

Appendix C

Route Option Appraisal

Overall Route Option 1 would involve selecting Route Option 1A, then either Route Option 1B or 1C, then either Route Option 1D or 1E, before finishing with Route Option 1F. Please refer to **Figure 4.4** which sets out the full extent of the Route Options.

Table C.1: Route Option 1A-1F Appraisal

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
Length of Route Option (km)	Length of Route Option (Holford Rule 3)	c. 21.1 km	c. 4.4km	c. 5.0km	c. 6.0km	c. 7.1km	c. 8.2km	The shortest route would be following Route Options 1A-1B-1D-1F.
Landscape and Visual Amenity	Locally Designated Landscapes, including Special Landscape Areas (SLAs) and the Pentland Hills Regional Park (Holford Rule 2)	Route Option 1A passes through the Pentland Hills SLA (WLC), Pentland Hills and Black Mount SLA (SLC), and the most westerly extents of the Water of Leith SLA (CoEC). In addition, the route passes through the north-western edge of Pentland Hills Regional Park. Some options exist to route part of the OHL to the north-west of the A70, beyond the boundary of the SLAs.	The entirety of Route Option 1B passes through the Pentland Hills and Black Mount SLA (SLC).	Route Option 1C passes through the Pentland Hills and Black Mount SLA (SLC), and a small portion of it passes through Pentland Hills SLA (SBC).	Route Option 1D passes through the Pentland Hills and Black Mount SLA (SLC), and Pentland Hills SLA (SBC).	Route Option 1E through the Pentland Hills SLA (SBC).	There are no locally designated landscape designations within Route Option 1F.	There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C, and 1D and 1E as they all cross SLAs.
	Landscape Character Types (LCT) (Holford Rules 4, 5, 6 and 7), including Landscape Susceptibility	Route Option 1A passes through four LCTs, with an overall medium susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 212: Moorland Hills - Glasgow and Clyde Valley (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 268: Upland Hills – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 269: Upland Fringes – Lothians (low susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 274: Lowlands Plain (low susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 1B passes through one LCT, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 212: Moorland Hills - Glasgow and Clyde Valley (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 1C passes through two LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 212: Moorland Hills - Glasgow and Clyde Valley (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ A small section of the route is within LCT 90: Dissected Plateau Moorland (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 1D passes through five LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 90: Dissected Plateau Moorland (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 99: Rolling Farmland – Borders (high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 102: Upland Fringe with Prominent Hills (medium susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 201: Plateau Farmland (low susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 212: Moorland Hills – Glasgow and Clyde Valley (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 1E passes through two LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 90: Dissected Plateau Moorland (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 99: Rolling Farmland – Borders (high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 1F passes through two LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 92: Plateau Outliers (medium susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 99: Rolling Farmland – Borders (high susceptibility for OHL) 	All of the Route Options cross at least one LCT with a medium-high susceptibility for OHL. Therefore, there is no preference for a Route Option on LCT grounds.
	Residential Visual Amenity with '150m trigger for consideration zone' (similar to Holford Rule 4)	Route Option 1A includes scattered settlement along the A70, skirting north of the settlement of Currie. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the	There are no residential receptors within Route Options 1B and 1C.	Route Option 1D includes scattered settlements. However, opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be	Route Options 1E includes scattered settlements. A sand and gravel quarry has been consented (Scottish Borders	There are a number of settlements within Route Option 1F, primarily positioned along the A701, including Damside, Romannobridge and	There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C . The consenting of the sand and gravel extraction	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		<p>dwelling will be possible at detailed routeing stage.</p>			possible at detailed routeing stage.	application ref: 24/00390/FUL) to the south of Slipperfield Loch which will reduce the ability to keep the route alignment away from residential properties.	properties south of West Linton. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage.	site to the south of Slipperfield Loch in Route Option 1E will reduce ability to keep away from properties – as north side of woodland at Slipperfield is closer to residents, so Route Option 1D is preferred.
	Visual Amenity (similar to Holford Rule 4)	<p>Route Option 1A may cut through coniferous forest and shelterbelts which run alongside the A70. Any wayleaves through existing forestry will result in a landscape impact.</p> <p>Although some areas of ancient woodland are present within this section, including at Glenpark, and are considered a key landscape feature. There are opportunities to avoid these.</p> <p>The start of Route Option 1A crosses the Cross Borders Drove Road near Harperrig Reservoir and may impact views experienced by recreational receptors.</p>	<p>Route Option 1B cuts across an area of very open higher land to the south-western end of the Pentland Hills. By avoiding the summits of hills and routeing at lower elevations, there is potential for the OHL to be largely backclothed by landform. However, it is likely that part of the OHL would be visible on the skyline crossing over the ridge of hills.</p> <p>Any wayleaves through existing forestry will result in a landscape impact.</p> <p>Receptors in this area are largely confined to people walking along the network of core paths and local footpaths.</p>	<p>Route Option 1C passes through, and / or alongside, the steeper, well-vegetated valley of Medwin Water. Compared to the surrounding area, the terrain of this valley is more complex in nature. Multiple changes in direction should be avoided by taking the OHL along the lower part of the hillside above the valley.</p> <p>The steep nature of the valley would mean that the OHL would be largely backclothed by landform and vegetation, however when crossing the ridge near White Craig, will result in the OHL being visible on the skyline.</p> <p>Receptors in this section are largely confined to people walking along the network of core paths and local footpaths and are likely to experience cumulative visual effects arising from the interaction of the OHL with the above ground Medwin Water pipeline and the existing supporting infrastructure for this.</p>	<p>Depending on more detailed routeing, the existing forestry and woodland within Route Option 1D provides opportunities to backcloth the OHL in some locations, along with the landform of North Muir and Mendick Hill. It will be preferable to seek a route across the lower rather than the upper slopes, backclothing against tree belts.</p>	<p>Route Option 1E should avoid cutting through coniferous forest and shelterbelts to the south-west of West Linton and at Slipperfield Mount; and instead use them to backcloth the OHL.</p> <p>The valley along Dry Burn is relatively narrow and steep in places, compared to some of the other route options, providing the sense of a smaller scale landscape. The valley slopes and flanks of North Muir will provide potential backclothing of the OHL.</p> <p>Receptors in this section are largely confined to people walking along the network of core paths and local footpaths, views from scattered residential properties, and from the golf course.</p>	<p>Route Option 1F should avoid cutting through coniferous forest and woodland shelterbelts near Romannobridge. The numerous blocks and shelterbelts of forestry and woodland will provide opportunities to backcloth the OHL.</p> <p>This Route Option passes over the Cross Borders Drove Road near Damside, and the A701. Receptors traveling along these routes will experience impacts upon their views.</p>	<p>Route Option 1B is marginally preferred to 1C as there is less potential for cumulative impacts (including the above-ground Medwin Water pipeline) on visual amenity receptors. However, further detailed routeing should avoid higher land on both routes where practicable to avoid visibility on the skyline.</p> <p>There is no preference between Route Options 1D and 1E.</p>
	Tourism and Recreation: potential for views from OS promoted viewpoints, Sustrans routes, Core Paths, long distance promoted trails, tourist attractions and recreational areas such as golf courses (Notes on Clarification to the Holford Rules)	<p>Route Option 1A crosses the north of the Cross Border Drove Road from the A70, near to Harperrig Reservoir.</p> <p>Route Option 1A also crosses the Pentland Hills Regional Park, which brings many visitors and hill walkers to the area.</p> <p>Several core paths pass through this Route Option, including City of Edinburgh Council core paths CEC16: Kirknewton, and CEC17: Riccarton.</p> <p>Furthermore, the local path network within Route Option 1A draws people into Pentland Hills</p>	<p>There are several core paths and aspirational core paths within Route Option 1B, including CL/3183/1, CL/3181/1, and CL/3184/1. Other paths form part of the wider network of routes.</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 1B.</p>	<p>Core path CL/3184/1 is located within Route Option 1C.</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 1C.</p>	<p>Route Option 1D crosses the Scottish Borders Council core path 169, as well as a promoted path, Roman Road and a Public Right of Way.</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 1D.</p>	<p>Route Option 1E crosses the Scottish Borders Council core path 169 (which follows the Roman Road), as well as a promoted path, and a Public Right of Way.</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 1E.</p>	<p>Route Option 1F passes the Cross Borders Drove Road as it crosses the A701 near Damside.</p> <p>Route Option 1F crosses Several Scottish Borders Council paths, including core path 168 and a Public Right of Way.</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 1F.</p>	<p>Route Option 1B is marginally preferred to Option 1C as it would cross fewer core paths, and aspirational core paths.</p> <p>There is no preference between Route Options 1D and 1E as they both would result in comparable impacts on a tourist and recreational amenity.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		Regional Park. Route Option 1A also passes the roadside National Cycle Network Route 75 north of Currie. There are no OS promoted viewpoints within Route Option 1A.						
	Overall preference for Landscape and Visual Amenity	Overall, Route Option 1A-1B-1D-1F is marginally the preferred route, however, the route will cross a number of SLAs and the Pentlands Hills Regional Park, and the impact on several core paths will need to be taken into consideration during detailed routeing. Route Option 1B is preferred to 1C as it crosses fewer core paths and provides more opportunity to backcloth the OHL against forestry, or on lower lying land, and minimise landscape and visual impacts through detailed routeing. Route Option 1D is marginally preferred to 1E as it has less potential to impact upon residential amenity receptors to the south of Slipperfield Loch when combined with committed development in the area (consented Slipperfield Quarry).						
Biodiversity	Ramsar Sites (Holford Rule 1)	There are no Ramsar sites within Route Options 1A, 1B or 1C, nor do they pass through the 2km trigger for consideration zone of any Ramsar site.			There are no Ramsar sites within Route Option 1D, but a small part is within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of the Westwater Ramsar site.	There are no Ramsar sites within Route Option 1E, but a large part is within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of the Westwater Ramsar site.	There are no Ramsar sites within Route Option 1F nor does it pass through the 2km trigger for consideration zone of any Ramsar site.	There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C in relation to impact on Ramsar sites. There is a slight preference for Route Option 1D as it is further away from the Westwater Ramsar site than Route Option 1E, although Route Option 1D still remains within the 2km trigger for consideration zone.
	Special Protection Areas (SPA) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SPAs within Route Options 1A, 1B and 1C nor do they pass through the 2km trigger for consideration zone of any SPAs.			There are no SPAs within Route Option 1D, but a small part is within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of the Westwater SPA.	There are no SPAs within Route Option 1E, but a large part is within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of the Westwater SPA.	There are no SPAs within Route Option 1F nor are there any SPAs located within 2km.	There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C in relation to impact on SPAs. There is a slight preference for Route Option 1D as it is further away from the SPA than Route Option 1E, although Route Option 1D still remains within the 2km trigger for consideration zone.
	Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) (Holford Rule 1)	Route Option 1A includes part of the Cobbinshaw Moss SSSI, but this can be avoided through routeing. Route Option 1A is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Craigengar SSSI.	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 1B.	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 1C. Route Option 1C is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Craigengar SSSI, passing around 20m from the SSSI ¹ .	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 1D. Route Option 1D is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Dolphinton – West Linton Fens and Grassland SSSI. SSSIs within 2km of Route Option 1D are: <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Dolphinton - West Linton Fens SSSI■ Grassland SSSI■ A small section of the Westwater Reservoir SSSI	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 1E. Route Option 1E is within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of the Westwater SSSI. <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Route Option 1E is within the 1km trigger for consideration zones of the Dolphinton – West Linton Fens and Grassland SSSI.	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 1F. Route Option 1F is not within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Dolphinton – West Linton Fens and Grassland SSSI.	Route Option 1B is preferred over 1C as 1B is further away from the Craigengar SSSI. There is no preference between Route Options 1D and 1E in terms of impact on SSSIs.

¹ The Craigengar SSSI is designated for its upland habitats and vascular plants.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
	Special Areas of Conservation (SAC) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SACs within Route Option 1A and 1B.		There are no SACs within Route Option 1C. Route Option 1C is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Craigengar SAC, passing within 20m from the SAC at its closest point.	There are no SACs within Route Option 1D.	Route Option 1E contains an approximate 3.3km stretch of the River Tweed SAC (following the West Water) which follows the northern boundary of the Route Option.	Route Option 1F contains an approximate 2.5km length of the River Tweed SAC which spans the width of the route option. However, the OHL could span the width of the SAC to avoid any direct impacts.	Route Option 1B is marginally preferred over Route Option 1C as it further away from SACs. Route Option 1D is preferred over Route Option 1E in terms of impact on SACs.
	Scottish Wildlife Trust (SWT) Reserves (Holford Rule 2)	None of the Route Options 1A, 1B, 1C, 1D, 1E and 1F contain a SWT Reserve.						There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to impacts on SWT Reserve.
	Local Nature Conservation Sites (LNCS), Local Biodiversity Sites (LBS) and Local Wildlife Sites (LWS) (Holford Rule 2)	<p>Four LNCS are located wholly within Route Option 1A:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Crosswood Reservoir (West Lothian) is located within the east of the Route Option but could be avoided by detailed routeing; ■ Auchinoon Quarry (West Lothian) is very small and although it is wholly within the Route Option, it would be easily avoidable through detailed routeing; ■ Dalmahoy Hill / Kaimes Hill / Ravelrig Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) spans the width of the Route Option and would likely require a wayleave through it; and ■ Crosswood Burn (biodiversity) which spans the width of the Route Option cannot be avoided. However, the proposed OHL could span the Crosswood Burn at its narrowest point. <p>Four further LNCSs are located within, or partly within, the Route Option which can be avoided through detailed routeing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Riccarton Estate (biodiversity); ■ Harlaw Reservoir/Water of 	There are no LNCS within Route Options 1B and 1C.		There are two LNCSs partly within Route Option 1D and both can be avoided through routeing: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Garvald Burn (biodiversity) ■ Ingraston Moss (biodiversity) 	<p>The Slipperfield Lochs (biodiversity) LNCS located entirely within Route Option 1E but could be avoided through detailed routeing.</p> <p>The White Moss (biodiversity) LNCS marginally crosses the Route Option but could be spanned or avoided through detailed routeing.</p>	There are two LNCSs entirely within Route Option 1F, and one partly within the Route Option but all of them could be avoided through detailed routeing: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Longstruther Burn (wildlife) ■ Bog Wood (biodiversity) ■ Spital Haugh (biodiversity) 	There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C in terms of impact on LNCSs. There is no preference between Route Options 1D and 1E in terms of impact on LNCSs as both Route Options can avoid LNCSs.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		<p>Leith/Bavelaw Burn/Black Springs/Threipmuir & Harlaw Reservoirs (biodiversity / geodiversity);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Harperrig Reservoir (biodiversity); and ■ Crosswood Burn Reservoir (biodiversity). 						
	Overall preference for Biodiversity	<p>Therefore, in terms of impact on Biodiversity, the marginally preferred Route Option is 1A-1B-1D-1F.</p> <p>Route Option 1B is preferred to 1C as it is further away from the Craigenar SSSI, and SACs.</p> <p>Route Option 1D is preferred to 1E as it is further away from the Westwater RAMSAR site and SAC.</p>						
Cultural Heritage	Scheduled Monuments (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are no Scheduled Monuments within Route Option 1A.</p> <p>There are few Scheduled Monuments within 3km of Route Option 1A, the closest being Camilty Hill enclosure (SM1165) and Camilty Hill / Castle Greg Roman fortlet (SM1933) situated c. 560m north of Route Option 1A. The Scheduled Monuments are situated within plantation woodland and are largely screened from the surrounding landscape. However, their elevated position may result in partial visibility of Route Option 1A.</p>	<p>There are no Scheduled Monuments within the Route Options 1B or 1C.</p> <p>No locations were identified within 3km of Route Options 1B and 1C where the introduction of grid infrastructure is likely to result in harmful effects as a result of changes in setting.</p>		<p>There are no Scheduled Monuments within Route Option 1D or 1E.</p> <p>Within 3km, Scheduled Monuments predominately comprise evidence for prehistoric domestic, ritual and funerary activity (e.g. SM3544 and SM5742). It is unlikely that these Scheduled Monuments will be subject to significant changes in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure. Careful placement and design of infrastructure and ancillary development is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>		<p>There are no Scheduled Monuments within Route Option 1F.</p> <p>Within the wider landscape Scheduled Monuments predominately include evidence for prehistoric defensive, domestic, ritual and funerary activity, e.g. Whiteside Hill fort (SM2955). The introduction of grid infrastructure on elevated ground within Route Option 3F may result in changes in setting. However, careful placement and design is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>	<p>There is no preference between the Route Options. Impacts on the setting of Scheduled Monuments located further afield adjacent to Route Options 1D / 1E and 1F should be taken into consideration within more detailed routeing.</p>
	Listed Buildings (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are six Listed Buildings within Route Option 1A, which are all Category B listed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Ainville (LB7363) an 18th century farm house; ■ The Old Schoolhouse, Causewayend Kirknewton (LB ref LB14158) a 19th century former school house; ■ Stables, Causewayend (LB14159) stable block associated with the former schoolhouse; ■ Wester Causewayend Farmhouse and Steading (LB18980), a listed farmstead 	<p>Only the Category B Listed Black Hill Farm (LB643), a 17th farm associated with the Covenanters, is located within Route Option 1B and 1C. This Listed Building may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, which could be harmful to its appreciation and understanding.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Options 1B and 1C, the Category B Covenanters' Grave, Black Law (LB643) and Category C Medwynhead House (LB8366) may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, that could be harmful to the cultural significance of the Listed Buildings. Careful route placement and design is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>It is unlikely that other Listed Buildings within 3km of the Route Option, such as those at Dunsyre, will be subject to setting changes.</p>		<p>There are four Listed Buildings within Route Option 1D; three category B and one Category C.</p> <p>The Category B buildings include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Medwynbank Sawmill (LB645) ■ Garvald House (LB8381) ■ Garvald Home Farm (LB8382) <p>These buildings all date from the early to mid- 19th century and pertain to the growth and expansion of Garvald and Ferniehaugh.</p> <p>The Category C Medwynhead House (LB8366) comprises an 18th century former farmstead.</p> <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a</p>	<p>There is one Listed Building within Route Option 1E: the Category C Medwynhead House (LB8366) an 18th century former farmstead.</p> <p>This Listed Building may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, which could be harmful to its appreciation and understanding.</p> <p>Listed Buildings within 3km of Route Option 1E are concentrated at the village of West Linton. It is unlikely that an OHL within Route Option 1E would be visible within the setting of these Listed Buildings, due to the screened from intervening topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is</p>	<p>There are 12 Listed Buildings within the Route Option 1F, 11 Category B and one Category C.</p> <p>These assets largely related to the post-medieval development of Romannobridge, Paulswell and the development of Halmyre Mains.</p> <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, that could be harmful to how the buildings are appreciated and understood today. Careful route alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>Listed Buildings within 3km of Route Option are concentrated at Newlands</p>	<p>There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C.</p> <p>Route Option 1E is preferred to 1D as there are fewer Listed Buildings located within it.</p> <p>There are likely to be unavoidable impacts as a consequence of setting change on Listed Buildings within the Route Option, which will need to be minimised as best practicable through the detailed routeing phase.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		<p>complex of early 19th century date. The Steading is divided into five distinct elements; and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Buteland Farm (LB26779) an early 19th century farm complex. ■ Glenbook Road (LB26857) 19th century stable block associated with former country house. <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, that could be harmful to how the buildings are appreciated and understood.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 1A, Listed Buildings are concentrated at Harburn House GDL, Glen Brook and Balerno on the outskirts of the City of Edinburgh. Route Option 1A is unlikely to appear to be seen within the setting of these Listed Buildings, as the route appears screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation. The introduction of an OHL is therefore unlikely to affect how the Listed Buildings are understood or appreciated.</p>			<p>change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, that could be harmful to how the buildings are appreciated and understood today.</p> <p>It is unlikely that other Listed Buildings within 3km of Route Option 1D, such as those at Dunsyre, and Newholm will be subject to changes in setting.</p>	<p>unlikely to affect how they would be otherwise understood or appreciated.</p>	<p>Church, Spitalhaugh and West Linton. It is unlikely that these buildings will be subject to significant changes in setting.</p>	
	Conservation Areas (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are no Conservation Areas within Route Option 1A.</p> <p>Within 3km of the Route Option there are the following Conservation Areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Currie (CA34) ■ Juniper Green (CA31) ■ Balerno (CA33) ■ Hermiston (CA39) ■ Kirknewton (CA376) <p>Route Option 1A does not appear to be sited on key views along routes through and / or toward these Conservation Areas so is</p>	There are no Conservation Areas within, or within 3km of, Route Options 1B, 1C and 1D.			<p>There are no Conservation Areas within Route Option 1E and 1F.</p> <p>The West Linton (CA631) Conservation Area is located within 3km of Route Options 1E and 1F.</p> <p>An OHL within Route Options 1E and 1F may be impact key views of the Conservation Area along routes which later run through the Conservation Area, including Core Paths 168 and 169. However, due to distance and screening by intervening topography, buildings and vegetation, it is unlikely that the introduction of grid infrastructure would be harmful to the understanding or appreciation of the Conservation Area.</p>	<p>There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C.</p> <p>Route Option 1D is preferred to 1E as there are no Conservation Areas within, or within 3km of, Route 1D.</p>	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference	
		unlikely to affect how they are experienced or perceived.							
	Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscapes (GDL) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no inventory GDLs within Route Option 1A. Harburn House (GDL00208) is situated c. 1.6km north of the central section of Route 1a. Information reviewed indicates that there are restricted views from the designed landscape and Listed Buildings at its core, towards the route option, and it is unlikely that the introduction of grid infrastructure would be harmful to the understanding or appreciation of the GDL.	There are no inventory GDLs within Route Options 1B, 1C, 1D, 1E and 1F or within 3km.						There is no preferred Route Option.
	Inventory of Historic Battlefields (Holford Rule 1)	There are no inventory historic battlefields within Route Options 1A, 1B, 1C, 1D, 1E and 1F or within 3km of the Route Options.						There is no preferred Route Option.	
	Non-designated heritage assets (Holford Rule 2)	There are 65 non-designated heritage assets located within Route Option 1A. Whilst evidence for later prehistoric occupation, Roman military features and roads are present within Route Option 1A (e.g. Canmore ID 72226), these assets largely comprise post-medieval farmsteads and associated agricultural features.	There are three non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 1B. These assets comprise one post-medieval farmstead (Canmore ID 181733), and two undated marker cairns (Canmore ID 90611 and 90620).	There are two non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 1C. These assets comprise undated ecclesiastical and agricultural sites: <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Rodgers Kirk (Canmore ID 49006)■ Blackhill Farm (Canmore ID 181773)	There are 42 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 1D. Whilst evidence for later prehistoric occupation, Roman military features and roads are present (e.g. the Border - Crawford - Inveresk Roman Road Canmore ID 71715), these assets largely comprise post-medieval farmsteads and associated agricultural features.	There are 38 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 1E. Evidence for early prehistoric occupation has been identified within Route Option 1E, through the recovery of flints, arrowheads and axe heads. Assets range in date and form, from later prehistoric funerary remains (Cairn Knowe Canmore ID 368956), Roman military features and roads (e.g. the Border - Crawford - Inveresk Roman Road Canmore ID 71716), through to post-medieval farmsteads and associated agricultural features.	There are 57 non-designated heritage assets located within Route Option 1F. These assets largely comprise evidence for medieval, post-medieval and modern agricultural features, such as farmsteads, byres and dovecots. Assets associated with post-medieval infrastructure and post Improvement settlement development are also present within the Route Option 1F.	Route Option 1C is marginally preferred to 1B as there are fewer non-designated heritage assets located in the Route Option. Route Option 1E is marginally preferred to 1D as there are fewer non-designated heritage assets located in the Route Option. Physical changes to these assets are to be avoided where possible and poles and associated infrastructure are to be sited in a way which does not disrupt how they can be understood in relation to contemporary/ related assets and the surrounding landscape.	
	Overall preference for Cultural Heritage	On balance, the overall preferred Route Option 1 comprises 1A-1C-1E-1F . Either 1B or 1C could be progressed with consideration to alignment through detailed design, however the preference for 1C over 1B is marginal with 1C containing fewer designated assets within the Route Option. Route Option 1E has been selected over 1D as this has fewer Listed Buildings and non-designated heritage assets within the Route Option.							
Forestry and Woodland	Ancient Woodland Inventory (AWI) (Holford Rule 1)	There are seventeen AWI records within, or partially within, Route Option 1A with a totalling 32.8 hectares. Through careful routeing, it is considered that all AWIs can be avoided.	There are no AWI records within Route Option 1B and 1C.	One AWI is partly within Route Option 1D, totalling 0.8 hectares. Through careful routeing, it is considered that the AWI can be avoided.		There are no AWIs within Route Option 1E and 1F.		There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C . Route Option 1E is preferred to 1D as there are no AWIs within 1E.	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference	
	Native Woodland Survey of Scotland (NWSS) (Holford Rule 2)	There are sixteen NWSS records within, or partially within Option 1A with a total area of 23.3 hectares. These can be avoided.	There are no NWSS records within Route Option 1B and 1C.		There is one NWSS record within Route Option 1D which is 1.1 hectares. This can be avoided through careful routeing.	There are five NWSS records within or partially within Route Option 1E, totalling 4.9 hectares; this can be avoided through careful routeing.	There are fourteen NWSS records within or partially within Option 1F with a total area 20.5 hectares. These can be avoided through careful routeing.	There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C. Route Option 1D is preferred to 1E as there are fewer NWSS records within it.	
	National Forest Inventory (NFI) (Holford Rule 5)	There are 99 NFI records within, or partially within, Route Option 1A totalling 329.5 hectares. Some loss of NFI forest cover would be unavoidable in this Route Option which may impact the viability of the route.	There are no NFI records within Route Option 1B and 1C.		There are 48 NFI records located within Option 1D, total area 60.5 hectares. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable on this Option.	There are 51 NFI records within Option 1E, with a total area of 65.6 hectares. Some loss for forest cover would be unavoidable on this Option.	There are 94 records within Option 1F with a total area of 382.8 hectares. Some loss for forest cover would be unavoidable on this Option.	There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C. Route Option 1D is marginally preferable to 1E with respect to impacting fewest hectares of NFI designated woodland, but detailed routeing may minimise impact on woodland further.	
	Overall preference for Forestry and Woodland	In terms of Forestry and Woodland, it is considered that 1A-1B/1C-1E-1F is the preferred route option. There is no preference between Route Options 1B and 1C. As Route Option 1E contains no AWIs compared to 1D which contains one AWI record, 1E is marginally preferred.							
Peat, Geology, Hydrology & Hydrogeology	NatureScot Priority Peatland Habitats (Class 1 and Class 2) (Holford Rule 1). NatureScot Peatland Habitats (Classes 3, 4 and 5).	Route Option 1A does not cross any priority peatland Habitat (Class 1 and 2). Route Option 1A crosses several areas of Class 5 peatland, noted on NatureScot mapping at the south extent of the route northeast of Harrows Law, at Camilty Plantation and just north of Shear Burn.	Route Option 1B does not cross any priority peatland habitat (Class 1 and 2). Route Option 1B crosses several areas of Class 5 peatland, noted on NatureScot mapping on the northwest and south sides of Harrows Law, north of Bleak Law and west of Cairn Knowe within the route.	Route Option 1C does not cross any priority peatland habitat (Class 1 and 2). Route Option 1C crosses several areas of Class 5 peat which are located west of White Craig, southeast of Whitecraig and north/east of Black Law. There are also small areas of Class 4 peat fringing the east side along the south of the route option (east of Medwin Water).	Route Option 1D does not cross any priority peatland habitat (Class 1 and 2). Route Option 1D crosses small areas of Class 3, 4 and 5 peat in the far west of the route, with an area of Class 5 peat near the Garvald Burn and Tarth Water that can be spanned or avoided.	Route Option 1E splits into two sections to route around White Moss Class 1 priority peatland habitat to connect onto Route Option 1F. However, Route Option 1E does still cross through this habitat. There are several sections of Class 3,4 and 5 peat within Route Option 1E, most of which are small and can be avoided. However, there is one large section of mostly Class 5 peat (some Class 3) which covered the entire width of Route Option 1E for a length of between 500m and 1300m that cannot be spanned or avoided.	Route Option 1F does not cross through any priority peatland habitat but it is adjacent to an area of Class 1 priority peatland at White Moss on its west side. There is also very small area of Class 4 peat within Route Option 1F which can be avoided.	There is evidence of peatland found throughout Route Options 1A, 1B and 1C; however, none of this peatland is priority peatland habitat. Some of this peatland will be avoidable through detailed routeing; however, in some sections it covers the full width of Route Option 1. Route Option 1B is preferred to 1C as this would avoid wider areas of Class 5 peat. Route Option 1D is preferred to 1E as this would avoid the Class 1 priority peatland habitat at White Moss, however, this can be avoided at the detailed routeing stage.	
	Geological Conservation Review (GCR) Areas	There are no GCR Areas located within Route Options 1A, 1B, 1C, 1D, 1E or 1F.							There is no overall route preference.
	Waterbodies / watercourses	Route Option 1A crosses several named and unnamed watercourses. These include the Dry Burn, Green Burn, small sections of Crosswood Burn, Shear Burn, Whitlea Burn and the Water of Leith.	Route Option 1B crosses a few named and unnamed watercourses including smaller tributaries to Darby Burn and West Water, as well as the West Water itself running through the centre/south.	Route Option 1C crosses a few named and unnamed watercourses including smaller tributaries of the Medwin Water and the Medwin Water itself which flows through the south/centre.	Route Option 1D crosses a few named and unnamed watercourses. These include the West Water in the west, the Medwin Water, the Garvald Burn, the Tarth Water and smaller tributaries.	Route Option 1E crosses a few named and unnamed watercourses including tributaries of the West Water, and the West Water itself, which flows within the northern part.	Route Option 1F crosses one main watercourse- the Lyne Water- with some smaller unnamed tributaries and the Dead Burn.	Route Option 1B is marginally preferred to 1C as it crosses fewer watercourses. Route Option 1E is marginally preferred to 1D as it crosses fewer watercourses. In rural areas there is a high likelihood of small burns and waterways	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference	
		Crosswood reservoir is located within the route option. Harperrig Reservoir is located close to Route Option 1A (within 100m and 40m from the boundary, respectively).						which will be able to be identified on a site visit.	
	Flood Zones and Drinking Water Protected Areas	Route Option 1A crosses two main areas of fluvial flood risk marked on the SEPA future flood maps (1 in 200-year plus climate change event) along the course of Green Burn and the Water of Leith. Neither are wider than 180m and are generally much shorter and can be spanned or avoided. Route Option 1A fringes on the boundaries of the South Medwin and Water of Leith Drinking Water Protected Areas (DWPA), but the route is downstream of both and the DWPA can be avoided. Crosswood Reservoir is operated by Scottish Water for the supply of drinking water.	Route Option 1B only has one flood risk area noted by SEPA future flood mapping - a small extent of the West Water in the southeast of the route. The flood risk area is narrow and can be spanned or avoided. Route Option 1B crosses through the upstream section of the South Medwin DWPA (Surface) (Waterbody ID 10933).	Route Option 1C has only one area of fluvial flood risk noted by SEPA future flood mapping, which is along the course of the Medwin Water, which flows within the route in the south. The flood risk extent is estimated at around 60m width at maximum and can be spanned. Route Option 1C crosses through the upstream section of the South Medwin DWPA (Surface) (Waterbody ID 10933).	There are three areas of fluvial risk within Route Option 1D noted by the SEPA future flood mapping, which are located along the West Water, Medwin Water and Tarth Water. However, the flood risk areas can be spanned or avoided within the route. Route Option 1D crosses through the upstream section of the South Medwin DWPA (Surface) (Waterbody ID 10933).	SEPA future flood maps indicate a narrow flood risk area in Route Option 1E, associated with the West Water within the route, however this can be avoided within the route option. Slipperfield Loch and two other unnamed waterbodies are also within the east of the route. Route Option 1E crosses through the West DWPA (Surface) (Waterbody ID 5320) and the South Medwin DWPA (Surface) (Waterbody ID 10933).	SEPA future flood maps indicate one key area of flood risk within the Route Option 1F, along the Lyne Water at Romannobridge. This is up to 650m wide in places in the north of the route, with narrower crossing points in the south of the route that are less than 120m wide. Route Option 1F crosses through the Lyne Water DWPA (Surface) (Waterbody ID 5312).	All of Route Option 1 crosses through DWPAs, however Route Option 1B is marginally preferred to 1C as it crosses fewer / smaller flood zones and DWPAs. Route Option 1D is marginally preferred to 1E as it crosses a large area not covered by a DWPA, while 1E passes entirely through a DWPA. The key flood risk area is within Route 1F, but this can be spanned with careful alignment in the south of the route, where the flood risk area it is at its narrowest (~120m wide).	
	Overall preference for Peat, Geology, Hydrology & Hydrogeology	The preferred route option is Route Options 1A-1B-1D-1F . Route Option 1B is preferred to 1C as it would span / avoid Class 5 peatland habitat (not priority habitat), crosses fewer watercourses, DWPAs and flood zones. Route Option 1D is marginally preferred to Route Option 1E it avoids Class 1 peatland near White Moss altogether, but Route Option 1D does cross directly through a DWPA.							
Planning and Land Use	Planning and Development: <ul style="list-style-type: none">Local Development Plan (LDP) Allocations. (Holford Rule 7)Committed Development (Consented and Undetermined² Planning Applications) since 2019³.	City of Edinburgh LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none">Housing Proposal: Riccarton Mains Road, Currie (HSG 35) – capacity for 25-35 homesHousing Proposal: Curriehill Road, Currie (HSG 36) - capacity for 50-70 homesHousing Proposal: Newmills Road, Balerno (HSG 37) – capacity for 175-245 homesHousing Proposal: Ravelrig Road, Balerno (HSG 38) – planning permission	City of Edinburgh – Route Options 1B-1F do not fall within CoEC.						In terms of planning and development there is no preferred route between Route Options 1B and 1C. Route Option 1D is slightly preferred over 1E as there are fewer committed developments within its boundary.

² Undetermined planning applications are those which have been validated, i.e. are 'live' applications, but have not yet been decided.

³ It is not considered that development prior to 2019 should be considered as these applications are likely to have expired if not implemented or fully built out and in situ within 5 years.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference	
		<p>granted in principle in 2015 for a housing development on the Site (planning refs. 14/02806/PPP and 14/02010/PPP)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Cycleway Footpath Safeguard: Off road alternative (NCNR 75) ■ Ravelrig Quarry Minerals Site (RS3, RS5) <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 21/01053/FUL – permission granted for 2 new dwellinghouses at The Mill House ■ 22/03017/FUL – permission granted for a new electricity feeder station from the railway at the proposed electricity substation, Riccarton Mains Road, Currie. Should the new electricity feeder pillar impact the design of the Cloich connection, this will be considered through the design stage. ■ 23/00373/FUL – permission to reposition the house plots at The Mill House <p>It is likely these can be avoided through detailed routeing.</p>							
		<p>West Lothian</p> <p>LDP Allocation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Policy MRMW 6: Pipeline Consultation Pipeline – requires the council to consult with the Health and Safety Executive and with Transco / BP, as appropriate, on development proposals which are located within pipeline consultation zones. Proposals will be refused where there is an unacceptable risk to human life. 	<p>West Lothian – Route Options 1B-1F do not fall within WLC.</p>						

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> LDP Site ref. P-41 is located approximately 1.3km from Route Option 1A, and comprises land reserved for the extension of the Pentland Hills Regional Park. The designation is demarcated by a point on the LDP map. It is not clear from the LDP Map whether the actual extent of the site reserved for the Pentland Hills expansion is likely to overlap with Route Option 1A. <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 0311/FUL/20 – permission granted for a second access to Camilty Wind Farm, at Camilty Plantation 0320/FUL/21 – permission granted for 6 turbines at Camilty Plantation 0300/FUL/23 – pending determination for eight houses near Kirknewton <p>It is likely these committed developments can be avoided through detailed routeing.</p>						
		<p>South Lanarkshire</p> <p>LDP Allocations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are no LDP site allocations. Minerals allocations: intermittent allocation of construction aggregates along LPA boundary. <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no committed development along route Option 1A within SLC as of 25/04/2024). 	<p>South Lanarkshire</p> <p>LDP Allocations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are no LDP site allocations. <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no committed development along route Option 1B within SLC as of 25/04/2024). 	<p>South Lanarkshire</p> <p>LDP Allocations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are no LDP site allocations. Minerals allocations: intermittent allocation of construction aggregates along LPA boundary. <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no committed development along route Option 1C and 1D within SLC as of 25/04/2024). 	<p>South Lanarkshire – Route Options 1E and 1F do not fall within SLC.</p>			
		<p>Scottish Borders – Route Options 1A and 1B do not fall within SBC.</p>		<p>Scottish Borders</p> <p>Committed Development</p>	<p>Scottish Borders</p> <p>Committed Development</p>	<p>Scottish Borders</p> <p>LDP Allocations</p>	<p>Scottish Borders</p> <p>LDP Allocations</p>	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference	
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no committed development along Route Option 1C within Scottish Borders Council (as of 25/04/24). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 21/01619/FUL – permission granted for 6 self-contained accommodation units on land south of Willow House, Garvald. <p>It is likely this committed development can be avoided through detailed routeing.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hazard pipeline buffers (IS12) <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 20/00575/S37 – consent granted for a 11kV overhead line refurbishment on land northwest and northeast of Tarfhaugh Farmhouse, West Linton. <p>The proposed quarry would span c.70% of Route Option 1E's width, however, the quarry could be avoided through detailed routeing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 22/01114/FUL – permission granted for two agricultural (sheep) buildings on land at Slipperfield Farm, West Linton. <p>It is likely that these committed developments can be avoided through detailed routeing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 21/00152/FUL – permission granted at appeal for a new sand and gravel quarry on land south of Slipperfield Loch, West Linton. <p>The above consented sand and gravel quarry is unlikely to enable a sufficient gap between the residential houses, the quarry and the route option, therefore this committed development cannot be avoided through detailed routeing.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hazard pipeline buffers (IS12) <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 22/01744/FUL - permission granted for a slurry lagoon at Hyndfordwells Farm, West Linton. The site area for the development is 0.78ha and it is not clear if this permission has been implemented / completed. <p>It is likely that these committed developments can be avoided through detailed routeing.</p>		
		Midlothian – None of the Route Options in route 1 fall within MLC.							
	Scotland Land Capability for Agriculture Classes 1, 2 and 3.1 (Holford Rule 7)	Route Option 1A includes small sections of prime agricultural land (Class 3.1) either side of Currie's conurbation and railway line. The OHL is not likely to impact the ability of the surrounding land to remain in agricultural use.	Route Options 1B, 1C, 1D, 1E and 1F do not contain any prime agricultural land.						There is no preferred route option as Route Options 1B/1C and 1D/1E do not contain any prime agricultural land.
	Coal Authority Reporting Area for Planning	Part of Route Option 1A to the west and south of Crosswood reservoir is located within a Coal	Route Options 1B, 1C, 1D, and 1E are not located within a Coal Authority Mining Reporting Area.				Route Option 1F resides within a Coal Authority Mining Reporting Area. A mine entry record is noted to the west of	There is no preferred route option as Route Options 1B/1C and 1D/1E are not within the Coal Authority's Reporting Area.	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		<p>Authority consultation area.</p> <p>A coal outcrop is noted as a 'development High Risk Area' to the south of Cobbinshaw Moss which would need to be avoided as best possible during detailed routeing.</p> <p>Some small old quarries are present to the north of Harperig Reservoir, however, these could be avoided or spanned at detailed route planning stage.</p>					Grassfield Forest which is also noted as a 'Development High Risk Area'. This should be avoided as best possible during detailed routeing.	
	Overall preference for Planning and Land Use	<p>The preferred route in terms of Planning and Land Use is via Route Options 1A-1B/C-1D-1F.</p> <p>There is no clear preference between Route Option 1B and 1C and either could be progressed through detailed design.</p> <p>Route Option 1D is preferred to 1E as there are fewer committed developments which would need to be designed around through the alignment stage.</p>						
Technical	Altitude and Topography	<p>Route 1A has the most even ground with around 80% having a gradient of less than 6°, although this rises to a maximum of 24° in some sections.</p> <p>In total, 95% of Route Option 1A is below 200m, with the highest altitude at c. 380m.</p> <p>Risk of steeper terrain within Leith Valley south of Ravelrig Quarry.</p>	<p>Route option 1B has a more uneven terrain with roughly 50% of this section having a gradient less than 6° with a maximum gradient of 28°.</p> <p>The entirety of Route Option 1B is above 200m, with the maximum altitude at c. 430m.</p>	<p>Approximately half of Route 1C has a gradient less than 6°, although this gradient reaches 52° in one area, this could pose significant difficulties for an overhead line route.</p> <p>The entirety of Route Option 1C is above 200m, with the maximum altitude at c. 420m.</p>	<p>Route option 1D has a more uneven terrain with roughly 50% of this section having a gradient less than 6° with a maximum gradient of 28°.</p> <p>The entirety of Route Option 1D is above 200m, with the maximum altitude at c. 310m.</p>	<p>Route 1E again has a more even surface with around 75% of the route with a gradient less than 6° and a maximum of 24°.</p> <p>The entirety of Route Option 1E is above 200m, with the maximum altitude at c. 320m.</p>	<p>Route 1F has a varied gradient along its route, with a long stretch of the route having a gradient of less than 6° and has a maximum gradient of 32°.</p> <p>The entirety of Route Option 1F is above 200m, with the maximum altitude at c. 375m.</p>	<p>Given the long length of this route, the slope varies significantly throughout. Almost the entire Route Option 1 has an altitude above 200m, except Route 1A of which approximately 95% is less than 200m.</p> <p>In Scotland, altitudes above 200m AOD are technically by design considered to be an extreme environment due to high wind and ice loading. The maximum altitude within Route 1 is approximately 430m.</p> <p>Route Option 1B is preferred to Route 1C and Route 1E is marginally preferred to 1D as the gradients are not as steeply sloped.</p>
	Infrastructure (Holford Rule 7)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 400kV Crossing ■ 132kV Crossing ■ 275 kV Crossing ■ Ten 11kV Crossings are located within this route option ■ A high-pressure gas pipeline is crossed twice, once near Buteland Farm and then again near Colzium Farm House. ■ High risk on entry to Currie substation, cable entry required. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ A private access track is noted within 1B which runs from Easton (to the north of Dolphinton) north past Carin Knowe and as far as Covenanter's Grave Hill. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ A private access track is noted within 1C, which roughly follows the route of the Medwin Water. this section connecting West Linton (to the west) to the A701. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Two 11kV Crossings are located within this route option, and low-voltage connections noted ■ The A702 road runs north-south in the most eastern portion of Route Option 1D. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Four 11kV Crossings are located within this route option, with a low voltage connection noted along the A702 ■ There is a potential high-pressure gas pipeline in Route Option 1E where the route runs alongside the pipe. ■ The A702 road runs north-south in the most eastern portion of Route Option 1E. Minor roads / track crossings are also included in Route 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Four 11kV Crossing are located within the route option, with two low-voltage connections noted near Romannobridge ■ Route Option 1F crosses a high-pressure gas line crossing near Hamilton Hall East. ■ The A701 crosses Route Option 1F running north-east to south-west. The B7059 is also noted within this section connecting West Linton (to the west) 	<p>There is no overall preference between Route Options 1B and 1C, as they do not contain existing A-Roads, trunk roads, rail infrastructure or any wind energy development.</p> <p>Route Option 1D is slightly preferred to Route Option 1E on the basis that it has less electrical infrastructure than 1E, and Route Option 1E does not have a suspected high-pressure gas line running through it.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Curriehill Railway Station lies within Route Option 1A with a possibility of a double crossing between Currie SIS and National Cycle Route 75. Cognisance of statutory clearance requirements for rail crossings are to be considered. ■ Deanfoot road and the A701 are also crossed within this route. ■ Approximately 15km of the A70 falls within Route Option 1A. ■ A number of minor road/track crossing along this route in which statutory clearance requirements will need to be considered. ■ Route Option 1A crosses the Tarmac Ravelrig Quarry, which has an amber risk rating due to known presence of mine workings. ■ Crosswood Reservoir will need to be spanned or avoided. 				Option 1E (including Bogsbank Road and Thief's Road)	to the A701. Minor road crossings also noted in Route Option 1F (B7509).	
	Overall Technical Preference	<p>The marginally preferred route in terms of Technical Considerations is Route Options 1A-1B/C-1D-1F as this route would cross the least amount of infrastructure.</p> <p>There is no clear preference between Route Option 1B and 1C and either could be progressed through detailed design.</p> <p>Route Option 1D is marginally preferred to 1E as it does not contain a suspected high pressure gas pipeline and cross fewer existing OHLs.</p>						
Overall Preferred Route Option	<p>The overall preferred Route Option 1 comprises 1A-1B-1D-1F (hereafter referred to as 'Overall Route Option 1').</p> <p>Overall Route Option 1 crosses through the Pentland Hills SLA and the Black Mount SLA, and crosses the north-western edge of Pentland Hills Regional Park. There are a number of visual amenity and residential receptors located throughout Overall Route Option 1, including residential receptors (scattered settlements), and the users of core paths. These will need to be considered further at the detailed routeing stage.</p> <p>Whilst Overall Route Option 1 does not contain any Ramsar sites, SPAs, or SWTs, Route Option 1 does cross the River Tweed SAC. Route Option 1A also includes part of the Cobbinshaw Reservoir SSSI, but this can be avoided through detailed routeing. There are six LNCS within Route Option 1; five of which can be avoided through detailed routeing. The Dalmahoy Hill LNCS cannot be spanned or avoided.</p> <p>There are 18 AWI records in total in Overall Route Option 1. These will need to be avoided where possible during detailed routeing.</p> <p>There is evidence of peatland throughout Route Options 1A and 1B; however, none of this peatland is classified as priority peatland habitat. Overall Route Option 1 crosses named and unnamed watercourses. The main flood risk area of note is within Route Option 1F; however, this can be spanned with careful routeing in the south of the route option, where the flood risk area it is at its narrowest (~120m wide). Route Options 1A, 1B and 1D also cross areas of fluvial flood risk, however it is thought that these areas can be spanned or avoided.</p> <p>The Ravelrig Quarry may pose a technical constraint to Overall Route Option 1 and will need to be considered at the detailed routeing stage.</p> <p>There are no Scheduled Monuments, Conservation Areas, GDLs, or Historic Battlefields within Overall Route Option 1. However, a number of Listed Buildings and known non-designated heritage assets are noted, with Route Option 1F containing the most Listed Buildings and Route Option 1A containing the most non-designated heritage assets. Therefore, there are likely to be unavoidable impacts on the setting of Listed Buildings and non-designated heritage assets.</p> <p>The comparative appraisal of Route Option 1B and Route Option 1C identified Route Option 1B as the preferred route option as it is shorter than Route Option 1C; it lies further away from the Craigengar SSSI and SAC; and it has potential to avoid Class 5 peatland habitat (not priority habitat). It also crosses fewer watercourses, DWPA's and flood zones.</p>							

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 1A	Route Option 1B (Optional)	Route Option 1C (Optional)	Route Option 1D (Optional)	Route Option 1E (Optional)	Route Option 1F	Preference
		<p>Route Option 1C also performed less well due to its potential landscape and visual impact on the high point at White Craig, the steep slopes between White Craig and Millstone Rig (which also pose a technical constraint), and the potential cumulative visual effects arising from the interaction of the OHL with the above ground Medwin Water pipeline and its existing supporting infrastructure. Furthermore, Route Option 1B crosses fewer core paths, and provides more opportunity to backcloth the OHL against forestry, or on lower lying land, and to minimise landscape and visual impacts through detailed routeing.</p> <p>The comparative appraisal of Route Option 1D and Route Option 1E identified Route Option 1D as the preferred route option as it is also the shortest route and lies further away from biodiversity receptors including the Westwater Ramsar and SAC. It is marginally preferred on landscape grounds and technical grounds as well as it has less potential to impact upon residential amenity receptors to the south of Slipperfield Loch when considered in combination with the consented Slipperfield Quarry.</p> <p>Route Option 1E also performed less well due to potential impacts on areas of potential priority peatland and because the route option also crosses more existing electrical and civil infrastructure including a possible high-pressure gas line. Route Options 1A, 1B and 1D also do not contain any SACs.</p>						

Appraisal of Route Option 2. There were no alternative Route Options considered within Route Option 2. Please refer to **Figure 4.4** which sets out the full extent of Route Option 2.

Table C.2: Route Option 2 Appraisal

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 2
Length of Route Option (km)	Length of Route Option (Holford Rule 3)	c. 25km
Landscape and Visual Amenity	Locally Designated Landscapes, including Special Landscape Areas (SLAs) and the Pentland Hills Regional Park (Holford Rule 2)	<p>North of Pentlands</p> <p>This section crosses the westerly extents of the Water of Leith SLA (CoEC).</p> <p>Pentlands</p> <p>This section of Route Option 2 passes through the Pentlands SLA (CEC) and the Pentland Hills Regional Park. Additionally, it passes along the boundary of Pentland Hills SLAs (SBC and MLC).</p> <p>South of Pentlands</p> <p>The most northern extent of this section of Route Option 2 is within the Pentland Hills SLA (SBC and MLC) boundaries. Elsewhere, there are no landscape designations. The village of Carlops is a Conservation Area.</p> <p>Summary</p> <p>The majority of the route passes through several locally and regionally designated landscapes including SLAs, a Regional Park, and other national designations including the Carlops Conservation Area.</p>
	Landscape Character Types (LCT) (Holford Rules 4, 5, 6 and 7), including Landscape Susceptibility	<p>North of Pentlands</p> <p>LCT 274: Lowland Plain (low susceptibility for OHL)</p> <p>Pentlands</p> <p>LCT 90: Dissected Plateau Moorland (medium-high susceptibility for OHL)</p> <p>LCT 268: Upland Hills – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL)</p> <p>LCT 269: Upland Fringes – Lothians (medium susceptibility for OHL)</p> <p>South of Pentlands</p> <p>LCT 92: Plateau Outliers (medium susceptibility for OHL)</p> <p>LCT 99: Rolling Farmland – Borders (high susceptibility for OHL)</p> <p>Summary</p> <p>The LCAs within this Route Option have a medium-high susceptibility to OHL development, particularly across the prominent Pentland Hills.</p>
	Residential Visual Amenity with '150m trigger for consideration zone' (similar to Holford Rule 4)	<p>North of Pentlands</p> <p>A number of scattered settlements are noted along the A70, skirting north of the settlement of Currie. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage.</p> <p>Pentlands</p> <p>There are two properties within this section of Route Option 2, situated by North Esk Reservoir and along the access track to the reservoir approximately 1km north-west of Carlops, however opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage.</p> <p>South of Pentlands</p> <p>This section of Route Option 2 may also cross the village of Carlops, including the entire Conservation Area, with a cluster of properties situated along the A702. Additionally, scattered properties and farmsteads along Deanfoot Road and A701 fall within this section of Route Option 2. It will be difficult to route more than 150m from the dwellings in Carlops at detailed routeing stage, however opportunities to underground existing OHL infrastructure near Carlops, and other mitigation techniques could be considered.</p> <p>Summary</p> <p>There are relatively few residential receptors within Route Option 2, and the OHL could avoid the 150m trigger zone for the majority of the route. However, the area around Carlops represents a pinchpoint which is more constrained. It may not be possible to maintain a 150m property trigger zone in this area.</p>
	Visual Amenity (similar to Holford Rule 4)	<p>North of Pentlands</p> <p>This route section may create wayleaves through shelterbelts near Currie and Balerno, should they be crossed.</p> <p>The introduction of an additional OHL would potentially increase cumulative effects arising from interaction with other OHLs of differing sizes in the areas surrounding these settlements.</p> <p>Pentlands</p> <p>The landform of the Pentland Hills is complex compared to the surrounding lowland plains and rolling agricultural land. The presence of an OHL in this area may therefore detract from views across this complex open landscape, which may be experienced from the many hill summits surrounding this section of Route Option 2, and from the footpaths which cut through this area. The OHL will introduce a linear feature in a landscape otherwise characterised by the curves of open hill summits and valley slopes. Route Option 2 is likely to result in the OHL being seen against the skyline when crossing the ridge. Potential cumulative effects may arise from interactions with the existing local distribution infrastructure extending from Carlops up to North Esk Reservoir, however opportunities to upgrade or underground this may reduce potential for cumulative effects.</p> <p>South of Pentlands</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 2
		<p>South of the Pentlands, there is potential for cumulative visual effects to arise near Carlops due to the presence of extensive local distribution infrastructure. However, these effects could be reduced by undergrounding the existing infrastructure and allowing a more sensitive route through the area for the proposed OHL.</p> <p>The visual prominence of the route may be reduced by the undulating landform providing screening, and opportunities to backcloth the route alongside the forestry at Deepsyke Forest.</p> <p>This section of Route 2 will require wayleaves to cross shelterbelts near Carlops, and to access the substation in Cloich Forest.</p> <p>Summary</p> <p>The sections of Route Option 2 to the north and south of the Pentlands are likely to result in less concern with relation to visual amenity, particularly if the existing infrastructure around Carlops can be undergrounded as a form of mitigation. However, routeing across the Pentland Hills raises greater concerns as the OHL would be visible from many hills and along popular walking routes in the Regional Park.</p>
	Tourism and Recreation: potential for views from OS promoted viewpoints, Sustrans routes, Core Paths, long distance promoted trails, tourist attractions and recreational areas such as golf courses and Country Parks (Notes on Clarification to the Holford Rules)	<p>North of Pentlands</p> <p>This section of Route Option 2 cuts across the on-road National Cycle Network (Route 75), north of Balerno.</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints or tourist attractions of note within this section of Route Option 2.</p> <p>Pentlands</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints or long-distance routes. However, the nearby summits of the Pentland Hills (e.g., East Cairn Hill) will have views to Route Option 2. In addition, the popular Pentlands ridge footpath crosses through the route option for approximately 0.7km. North Esk Reservoir serves as a popular destination for walkers within the Pentland Hills Regional Park, with a Public Right of Way path leading to it which runs along the length of the route option from Carlops to the ridge footpath.</p> <p>South of Pentlands</p> <p>There are no OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note within this section of Route Option 2. However, Carlops and the River North Esk may draw visitors. Scottish Borders core paths 164, 165, and 166 pass through this section, as well as a Public Right of Way path.</p> <p>Summary</p> <p>There are several well-used trails within the Pentlands. There are no promoted viewpoints or other tourism and recreational facilities along this route, though it is noted that the Pentland Hills Regional Park is popular and well visited by hill walkers, cyclists and cross-country skiers in winter.</p>
Biodiversity	Ramsar Sites (Holford Rule 1)	There are no Ramsar Sites within Route Option 2, and it is not within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of a Ramsar site.
	Special Protection Areas (SPA) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SPAs within 2km of Route Option 2 and it is not within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of a SPA.
	Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are two SSSIs with sections that are partly within Route Option 2. North Esk Valley SSSI includes biological and geological qualifying features including lowland acid grassland and valley fen habitat; a section of this SSSI entirely spans the Route Option and cannot be avoided through routeing. Carlops Meltwater Channels SSSI qualifies for geological features.</p> <p>Route Option 2 is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of Lynslie Burn SSSI, which is designated for its geology.</p>
	Special Areas of Conservation (SAC) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SACs within Route Option 2.
	Scottish Wildlife Trust (SWT) Reserves (Holford Rule 2)	There are no SWT Reserves within Route Option 2
	Local Nature Conservation Sites (LNCS), Local Biodiversity Sites (LBS) and Local Wildlife Sites (LWS) (Holford Rule 2)	<p>There are nine LNCSs partly within Route Option 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Riccarton Estate (biodiversity) ■ Dalmahoy Hill / Kaimes Hill / Ravelrig Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) ■ Water of Leith LNCS (?) ■ Harelaw Reservoir/Water of Leith/Bavelaw Burn/Black Springs/Threipmuir & Harlaw Reservoirs (biodiversity / geodiversity) ■ Fairliehope Burn (biodiversity) ■ Scroggy Brae (biodiversity) ■ River North Esk – Dalkeith to Carlops (biodiversity) ■ Carlops Dean (biodiversity) ■ The Linn, Hollow Haugh (wildlife) – also a locally designated wildlife site ■ Pond Knowe, Macabiehill (biodiversity) <p>Dalmahoy Hill / Ravelrig Quarry cannot be avoided through detailed routeing, whereas it is likely that Harelaw Reservoir can be spanned.</p>
Cultural Heritage	Scheduled Monuments (Holford Rule 1)	There are no scheduled monuments within Route Option 2.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 2
		<p>There are few scheduled monuments within 3 km of the route option, the most notable being prehistoric defensive structures and a post-medieval quarry. The closest monuments comprise, Bents Quarry (SM6065) situated 120m away, Dalmahoy Hill fort (SM1213) situated 500m away, and Kaimes Hill fort (SM1172) located 550m away. Due to the elevated position of the prehistoric monuments within the landscape it is likely that the introduction of grid infrastructure could result in changes in setting.</p> <p>Old Deepsykehead Neolithic long cairn (SM2789), located c.800m east of Option 2, represents a rare example of a monument type not generally associated with southern Scotland. Although situated within and screened by plantation forest, setting change to this asset – given the monument type’s close association with topography and other assets in the landscape – careful consideration will be required at design stage. Similarly, Old Deepsykehead enclosed cremation cemetery (SM2678), located within 200m of the corridor, requires careful consideration in design – as does the elevated potential for additional, related, Bronze Age material in the vicinity. (Bents Quarry lime kilns (SM6065) are not considered highly susceptible but will also require consideration.</p>
	Listed Buildings (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are 15 Listed Buildings located in Route Option 2; 11 of which are Category B and four of Category C.</p> <p>Thirteen of the Listed Buildings are situated in the Carlops Conservation Area, and largely comprise 18th century weavers’ cottages and the growing development of the village during this period, associated with the weaving industry.</p> <p>Outside the Carlops Conservation Area, the other Listed Buildings within Route Option 2 are Butelands Farm (LB26779); a 19th century farm complex, and Glenbook Road (LB26857); and a 19th century stable.</p> <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, which could be harmful to how these buildings are appreciated and understood today. The route alignment, pole placement and design, will be key to the reduction of significant effects.</p> <p>Outside Route Option 2, and within 3 km of the proposed route, Listed Buildings are concentrated at West Linton and Newhall. Route Option 2 does not appear to be located within the setting of these Listed Buildings, as it is likely views would be screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation. Therefore, it is unlikely to affect how these assets are understood or appreciated.</p>
	Conservation Areas (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There is one Conservation Area within Route Option 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Carlops CA – 18th century historic village core established for the cotton weaving industry. <p>The introduction of grid infrastructure may alter how the Conservation Area is experienced, however, careful route alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 2 the following Conservation Areas have been identified:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Currie (CA34) ■ Juniper Green (CA31) ■ Balerno (CA33) ■ Hermiston (CA39) ■ Kirknewton (CA376) <p>Route Option 2 does not appear to be located on key views through and towards these Conservation Areas and so is unlikely to affect how these Conservation Areas are experienced or perceived.</p>
	Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscapes (GDL) (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are no GLDs within Route Option 2.</p> <p>Newhall GDL (GDL00297) is located approximately 175m east of the central route option. Newhall GDL comprises a picturesque landscape laid out along the glen on the River North Esk and is associated with the Category B Newhall House, an 18th century house, and walled gardens.</p> <p>There will likely be partial visibility of OHL located within Route Option 2, although the introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to alter how the GDL is perceived, and with careful route alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>
	Inventory Historic Battlefields (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are no inventory historic battlefields within Route Option 2 or within 3km.</p>
	Non-designated heritage assets (Holford Rule 2)	<p>There are 109 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 2.</p> <p>These assets largely comprise evidence for medieval, post-medieval and modern agricultural features, such as farmsteads, byres and dovecots. Assets associated with post-medieval infrastructure and industry, including quarrying, toll roads, tile works and bridges, as well as and post-improvement settlement are also present within Route Option 2.</p> <p>Physical changes to these assets are to be avoided where possible and poles are to be sited in a way which does not disrupt how they can be understood in relation to contemporary/ related assets and the surrounding landscape.</p>
Forestry and Woodland	Ancient Woodland Inventory (AWI) (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are 21 AWI records located within or partially within Route Option 2, totalling 62.1 hectares. It is considered that these could be avoided through detailed routeing.</p>
	Native Woodland Survey of Scotland (NWSS) (Holford Rule 2)	<p>There are 19 NWSS records located within or partially within Route Option 2, totalling 24.4 hectares. It is considered that most of these could be avoided through detailed routeing, but some impacts on the more northerly blocks may be unavoidable.</p>
	National Forest Inventory (NFI) (Holford Rule 5)	<p>There are 90 NFI records within or partially within Route Option 2, totalling 190.1 hectares. Some loss of NFI forest cover would be unavoidable in this Route Option which may impact the viability of the route.</p>
Peat, Geology, Hydrology & Hydrogeology	NatureScot Priority Peatland Habitats (Class 1 and Class 2) (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are no areas of priority Class 1 or 2 peatland within Route Option 2.</p> <p>The route crosses several small sections of Class 4 and 5 peat in the south of the route before reaching wide areas of Class 3, 4 and 5 peatland in the centre and north of the route (from north of Carlops across the Pentlands, extending to north of the Bavelaw Burn). Some of these areas of peat are over 1.7km wide and cannot be spanned or avoided.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 2
	NatureScot Peatland Habitats (Classes 3, 4 and 5)	Where peat is found, it is likely that there will be some technical difficulties and increase cost, with special foundations and bog shoes required for construction.
	Geological Conservation Review (GCR) Areas	Route Option 2 partly crosses the Gutterford Burn GCR around the North Esk Reservoir and the Carlops GCR which stretches approximately 6km north-east to south-west from Auchencorth Moss to the Lyne Water watercourse. It is likely that the two GCR records informed the designation of the North Esk Valley SSSI and the Carlops Meltwater Channels SSSI. Provided that the poles can be placed such that they do not alter the existing landforms, there appears to be little technical reason why the presence of this Conservation Area should prevent the use of Route Option 2, in particular it is likely to be possible to span much of this area, thereby limiting the requirement for the establishment of poles to support the future overhead cable. This would need to be subject to detailed discussions with Nature Scot.
	Waterbodies / watercourses	Route Option 2 crosses numerous named and unnamed watercourse along its extent. These include Dead Burn, Cairn Burn, Harlawmuir Burn, Fairliehope Burn, Gutterford Burn, Henshaw Burn, Bavelaw Burn and Cock Burn. The upper extent of the River North Esk also runs through Route Option 2. North Esk Reservoir is also within Route Option 2 but could be avoided.
	Flood Zones and Drinking Water Protected Areas	SEPA future flood mapping indicates narrow flood risk areas along the courses of Dead Burn, Cairn Burn the River North Esk and Bavelaw Burn. None of these flood risk areas are particularly wide and can be easily spanned or avoided within Route Option 2. Route Option 2 does not cross any DWPAs.
Planning and Land Use	Planning and Development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Local Development Plan (LDP) Allocations. (Holford Rule 7) ■ Committed Development (Consented and Undetermined⁴ Planning Applications) since 2019⁵. 	City of Edinburgh LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ There are no LDP site allocations. Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 22/03017/FUL – permission granted for a new electricity feeder station from the railway at the proposed electricity substation, Riccarton Mains Road, Currie. Should the new electricity feeder pillar impact the design of the Cloich connection, this will be considered through the design stage This development will inform the design of the Cloich Forest Wind Farm Connection Project in due course.
		West Lothian – Route Option 2 does not fall in WL.
		South Lanarkshire – Route Option 2 does not fall in SL.
		Scottish Borders LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ There are no LDP site allocations. Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 19/00153/FUL - pending determination by the council in relation to the 'Erection of and change of use to form holiday leisure centre comprising of 100 holiday lodges, 10 tree lodges, 10 cabins/pods, 30 glamping pods, 3 no sales cabins, refurbishment and extension of existing clubhouse, erection of two buildings and associated works to form leisure complex with retail, leisure facilities, food and drink'. Further information has been submitted to progress the application which has triggered another round of statutory consultation. If approved, can be avoided through detailed routing by bypassing the site to the east.
		Midlothian LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ There are no LDP site allocations. Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ There is no committed development along Route Option 2 within Midlothian Council (as of the 25/04/24).
Scotland Land Capability for Agriculture (LCA) Classes 1, 2 and 3.1 (Holford Rule 7)	Class 2 and 3.1 prime agricultural land is found at the start of the route either side of Currie's railway line. This cannot be avoided through routing. Route Option 2 does not contain any further prime agricultural land (Classes 1, 2, or 3.1).	
Coal Authority Reporting Area for Planning	Route Option 2 falls within the Coal Consultation Area around Carlops, to the south-east of the Route Option. It falls partly within a 'Development High Risk Area' on account of it being potentially subject to change, with probably shallow coal mine workings noted. It is understood that a number of boreholes were historically drilled immediately south of Carlops Village to try and prove an oil shale seam. Further assessment with regard to this mineral would be necessary during more detailed route planning, albeit it should be possible to avoid or span over any areas of concern.	
Technical	Altitude and Topography	Most of Route Option 2 has an altitude above 200m. The maximum altitude within Route 2 is approximately 400m. In Scotland, altitudes above 200m AOD are technically, by design, considered to be an extreme environment due to high wind and ice loading. Given the long length of this route, the slope varies significantly throughout, the first section remains mostly below 6°, before becoming more uneven along the rest of the route, with only approximately half of the route with a gradient less than 6°. Around 5% of this route has a technically difficult gradient above 22°, with a maximum of approximately 39°.

⁴ Undetermined planning applications are those which have been validated, i.e. are 'live' applications, but have not yet been decided.

⁵ It is not considered that development prior to 2019 should be considered as these applications are likely to have expired if not implemented or fully built out and in situ within 5 years.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 2
	<p>Infrastructure (Holford Rule 7)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Existing OHL transmission and distribution infrastructure ■ SP Energy Networks Land Use Risks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Crossing 400kV ■ Crossing 33kV ■ 132kV Crossing ■ 275 kV Crossing ■ Twelve 11kV crossings are located within Route Option 2, with a low-voltage connection also noted within the route option ■ Curriehill Railway Station lies within Route Option 2, with a possibility of a double crossing between Currie SIS and National Cycle Route 75. Cognisance of statutory clearance requirements for rail crossings will be required during detailed routeing. ■ A number of minor road/track crossing along this route in which statutory clearance requirements will need to be considered. Deanfoot Road and the A701 are also crossed within this route. The A70 road runs along the most northern boundary of Route Option 2. The A702 road runs north-south across the middle of Route Option 2. ■ Route Option 2 crosses the Tarmac Ravelrig Quarry, which has an amber risk rating due to known presence of mine workings. ■ A high-pressure gas pipeline is crossed near Buteland farm, a full utility search would be required to establish extents of all utility services found within the route option.
Overall Preferred Route Option		<p>Route Option 2 is the only route option and is therefore the preferred route for this section of the proposed overhead line.</p> <p>However, it must be noted that the majority of the route passes through several locally and regionally designated landscapes including SLAs, a Regional Park, and other national designations including the Carlops Conservation Area.</p>

Overall, Route Option 3 would involve selecting Route Option 3A and 3B, then selecting either Route Option 3C or 3D, before finishing with Route Option 3E. Please refer to **Figure 4.4** which sets out the full extent of the Route Options.

Table C.3: Route Options 3A-3E Appraisal

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
Length of Route Option (km)	Length of Route Option (Holford Rule 3)	c. 21.3 km	c. 8.9 km	c. 6.1 km	c. 5.3 km	c. 5.5 km	Route Option 3D is preferred to 3C as it is the shortest route.
Landscape and Visual Amenity	Locally Designated Landscapes, including Special Landscape Areas (SLAs) and the Pentland Hills Regional Park (Holford Rule 2)	Route Option 3A passes through the Pentlands SLA (CoEC), the most westerly extents of the Water of Leith SLA (CoEC), and the northern edge of Pentland Hills Regional Park. Additionally, it passes through the northern tip of Bonaly Country Park, and the northern portion of Swanston Conservation Area.	Route Option 3B passes through the Pentland Hills SLA (MLC). It passes adjacent to the north-western edge of the Penicuik Garden and Designed Landscape.	The majority of Route Option 3C passes through the Pentland Hills SLA (MLC).	Almost the entirety of Route Option 3D passes through the Pentland Hills SLA (MLC). It passes to the west of the Penicuik Garden and Designed Landscape – but not through.	There are no locally or regionally designated landscape designations within Route Option 3E.	Route Option 3C is marginally preferred to 3D as 3D runs along the western boundary of the Penicuik Garden and Designed Landscape.
	Landscape Character Types (LCT) (Holford Rules 4, 5, 6 and 7), including Landscape Susceptibility	Route Option 3A passes through four LCTs, with an overall medium susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 268: Upland Hills – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 269: Upland Fringes – Lothians (low susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 270: Lowland river Valleys – Lothians (medium susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 274: Lowland Plain (low susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 3B passes through two LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 268: Upland Hills – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 270: Lowland river Valleys – Lothians (medium susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 3C passes through one LCT, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 269: Upland Fringes – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 3D passes through two LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 269: Upland Fringes – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 270: Lowland river Valleys – Lothians (medium susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 3E passes through two LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 92: Plateau Outliers (medium susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 99: Rolling Farmland – Borders (high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 3C is marginally preferred to 3D as 3D crosses more LCTs with an overall medium-high sensitivity to OHL development.
	Residential Visual Amenity with '150m trigger for consideration zone' (similar to Holford Rule 4)	Route Option 3A includes a number of scattered settlements along much of its route, including; north of the villages of Currie and Balerno, along the A701, south of the Bonaly area, and between Swanston and the Edinburgh Bypass. Generally, opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage, however a pinchpoint around Bonaly Tower may need this buffer distance to be reduced.	Route Option 3B broadly follows the A702 along the north-western edge of Penicuik and contains scattered properties and farmsteads along the A702 and other minor roads in the area. This wider area is quite constrained, particularly near the northern end, so it may be difficult to maintain a 150m separation distance from properties. Opportunities to maintain maximum separation from the dwellings may be possible at detailed routeing stage.	There are two residential dwellings located in Route Option 3C: one situated on the A702 and one on an unclassified road further south at Marfield. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage.	There is one dwelling located in Route Option 3D, which lies adjacent to the A702 at Braidwoods. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwelling will be possible at detailed routeing stage.	Route Option 3E contains scattered residential dwellings, clustered around the A701 near Lamancha. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage.	Route Option 3D is marginally preferred to 3C as there are fewer residential receptors within Route Option 3D.
	Visual Amenity (similar to Holford Rule 4)	Route Option 3A is likely to impact shelterbelts and areas of ancient woodland to the south of Balerno and Currie, and also near Bonaly, the removal of which would impact key landscape features. The introduction of an OHL within Route Option 3A would result in the greater encirclement of the settlements of Currie and Balerno, and potentially increase	Route Option 3B runs parallel to the A702 road and receptors travelling along the A702 may experience sequential views of the OHL for up to 9km. Route Option 3B will require the removal of shelterbelts and areas of ancient woodland which are likely to be crossed along the A702.	The northern section of Route Option 3C runs parallel to the A702 and receptors travelling along the A702 may experience sequential views of the OHL for a couple of kilometres. The complex topography of the River North Esk gorge will present technical challenges as well as resulting in the OHL interrupting the visual composition of this area (although	Route Option 3D crosses the River North Esk gorge. The complex topography of the River North Esk gorge may lend itself to an OHL interrupting the visual composition of this area (although noting that an existing OHL crosses the gorge). There is potential to upgrade the existing OHL to reduce the need for several OHLs in this area. The peatland of Auchencorth Moss has been commercially harvested	Route Option 3E is likely to result in the removal of shelterbelts around Lamancha and in Cloich Forest. Routeing adjacent to Deepsyke Forest will enable the OHL to be backclothed by trees. The peatland east of the forest has been commercially harvested so the introduction of an OHL is unlikely to detract substantially from the area, particularly if backclothed.	There is no overall route preference , as all Route Options result in comparable impacts on visual amenity.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
		cumulative effects arising from interaction with other OHLs of differing sizes in the area to the north and south of the settlements. The higher elevation of the OHL in comparison to Currie and Balerno may mean the OHL appears against the skyline (depending on route location). However, it could also enable backclothing by landform of the Pentlands.	Extensive mature vegetation along Route Option 3B will provide some screening of the OHL (particularly if located east of the A702) and may also provide backclothing. The landform of the Pentland Hills will also provide backclothing reducing the visual prominence of the OHL but still potentially interrupting views towards the Pentland Hills.	noting that an existing OHL crosses the gorge). There is potential to upgrade the existing OHL to reduce the need for several OHLs in this area. Generally, there are few receptors in this area, although some recreational walkers may walk along the footpath on Auchencorth Moss. Routeing adjacent to Deepsyke Forest will enable the OHL to be backclothed by trees. The peatland of Auchencorth Moss has been commercially harvested so the introduction of an OHL is unlikely to detract substantially from the area, particularly if backclothed.	so the introduction of an OHL is unlikely to detract substantially from the area. However, crossing Auchencorth Moss may result in the OHL appearing on the skyline from some locations.		
	Tourism and Recreation: potential for views from OS promoted viewpoints, Sustrans routes, Core Paths, long distance promoted trails, tourist attractions and recreational areas such as golf courses and Country Parks (Notes on Clarification to the Holford Rules)	Route Option 3A crosses a number of core paths, including City of Edinburgh Council core paths CEC 2: The Braids, CEC 19: Harlaw and Threipmuir, AND CEC 20: Bonaly and Bonaly Links. Core paths lead to the Pentland Hills Regional Park, and local designations such as the Red Moss of Balerno Nature Reserve and Bonaly Country Park. Route Option 3A also passes the on-road National Cycle Network (Route 75) north of Currie. Route Option 3A does not cross any further OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note. The Swanston Golf Course is immediately adjacent to the route option, and part of its driving range is within the section under the existing OHLs.	Many core paths are present within Route Option 3B, primarily leading off the A702 into the Pentland Hills or towards settlement. The most westerly extents of this section are within the Pentlands Regional Park. Route Option 3B does not cross any further OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note.	Route Option 3C crosses a Scottish Borders Council Public Right of Way, which starts at Deanfoot Road and follows the edge of Auchencorth Moss. Route Option 3C does not cross any further OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note.	Route Option 3D does not cross any OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note. However, the nearby Gowk Stone, located approximately 32m east of the route corridor near Auchencorth, Penicuik (320394, 657639) may attract some visitors for its heritage importance.	There are no OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note within this section.	Route Option 3D is preferred to 3C as there are no tourism and recreation receptors located within it.
	Overall preference for Landscape and Visual Amenity	<p>There is no overall preference for the Route Option with respect to Landscape and Visual Amenity.</p> <p>Route Option 3C passes through fewer LCTs, and avoids proximity to Garden and Designated Landscapes, but 3D avoids more residential, tourist and residential amenity.</p> <p>Route Option 3 will cross through the Pentland Hills SLA, and Pentlands SLA.</p>					
Biodiversity	Ramsar Sites (Holford Rule 1)	There are no Ramsar sites in Route Options 3A, 3B, 3C, 3D, and 3E and the route options are not within the 2km trigger for consideration zones of any Ramsar sites.					There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to potential impacts on Ramsar sites.
	Special Protection Areas (SPA) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SPAs in Route Options 3A, 3B, 3C, 3D, and 3E or within 2km the route options are not within the 2km trigger for consideration zones of any SPAs.					There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to potential impacts on SPAs.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
	Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are no SSSIs within Route Option 3A.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Route Option is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Balerno Common SSSI. 	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 3B.	<p>Auchencorth Moss SSSI is partly within Route Option 3C and is designated for its raised bog habitat – this cannot be avoided through routeing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Route Option 3C is within the 1km trigger for consideration zones of the Carlops Meltwater Channels SSSI (geological features) and the Whim Bog SSSI (raised bog). 	<p>Auchencorth Moss SSSI is partly within Route Option 3D and is designated for its raised bog habitat – this cannot be avoided through routeing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Route Option 3D is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Whim Bog SSSI (raised bog). 	<p>Two SSSIs are partly located within Route Option 3E:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Auchencorth Moss, designated for its raised bog habitat and which cannot be avoided through routeing; and Whim Bog designated for raised bog habitat, which can be avoided through routeing. 	Route Option 3C is marginally preferred over 3D as it contains a smaller area of the Auchencorth within it.
	Special Areas of Conservation (SAC) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SACs in Route Options 3A, 3B, 3C, 3D, and 3E.					There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to impacts on SACs.
	Scottish Wildlife Trust (SWT) Reserves (Holford Rule 2)	The Erraid Wood SWT reserve partly overlaps with Route Option 3A but can be avoided through routeing.	There are no SWT reserves in Route Options 3B, 3C, 3D and 3E.			There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the Route Options in relation to impacts on SWTs.	
	Local Nature Conservation Sites (LNCS), Local Biodiversity Sites (LBS) and Local Wildlife Sites (LWS) (Holford Rule 2)	<p>There are nine LNCSs within, or partially within, Route Option 3A:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Riccarton Estate (biodiversity) Dalmahoy Hill / Kaimes Hill / Ravelrig Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) Harelaw Reservoir/Water of Leith/Bavelaw Burn/Black Springs/Threipmuir & Harlaw Reservoirs (biodiversity / geodiversity) Water of Leith - Inveroe to Glenbrook & Cock Burn (biodiversity) Bavelaw Burn (biodiversity) Torphin Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) Howden Burn/Redford Brae & Laverock Dale/Torduff Reservoir & Bonaly Burn Swanston Burn (biodiversity) Erraid Wood (biodiversity) <p>Dalmahoy Hill / Kaimes Hill / Ravelrig Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) LNCS crosses the width of the Route Option and cannot be avoided or spanned.</p> <p>Route Option 3A crosses the Harelaw Reservoir LNS three</p>	<p>There are three LNCSs partly within Route Option 3B:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bush Estate (biodiversity) Bush Estate and Glencorse Burn (biodiversity) Glencorse Valley and Logan Burn (biodiversity) <p>The full width of Route Option 3B crosses the Glencorse Valley and Logan Burn LNCS, but as it is only 20m wide it is likely that this can be spanned.</p>	<p>The full width of Route Option 3C crosses three LNCS:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> River North Esk – Dalkeith to Carlops River North Esk - Drumbuie to Brunston Castle Hare Moss and Auchencorth Moss <p>The River North Esk – Drumbuie to Brunston Castle, and Hare Moss and Auchencorth Moss cannot be spanned or avoided. The River North Esk to Dalkeith LNCS resides within the boundary of the River North Esk to Drumbuie LNCS but can be spanned as it is approximately 25-30m wide.</p>	<p>The full width of Route Option 3D crosses three LNCS:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> River North Esk – Dalkeith to Carlops (biodiversity) River North Esk - Drumbuie to Brunston Castle (biodiversity) Hare Moss and Auchencorth Moss (biodiversity) <p>Part of the Penicuik House Estate LNCS also falls within Route Option 3D, but it could be avoided through detailed routeing.</p> <p>The River North Esk – Drumbuie to Brunston Castle, and Hare Moss and Auchencorth Moss cannot be spanned or avoided. The River North Esk to Dalkeith LNCS resides within the boundary of the River North Esk to Drumbuie LNCS but can be spanned as it is approximately 25-30m wide.</p>	There are no LNCS within Route Option 3E.	Route 3C is marginally preferred to Route 3D, as there is one less LNCS designation located within it to avoid. However, it is considered that as it can be avoided, overall, there is no preferred route option in relation to potential impacts on LNCS / LWSs.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
		times, and the Howden Burn LNCS twice. However, is likely these can be spanned at their narrowest points at the detailed routing stage.					
	Overall preference for Biodiversity	There is no overall preference between Route Options 3C and 3D as they result in comparable impacts to biodiversity.					
Cultural Heritage	Scheduled Monuments (Holford Rule 1)	<p>The Harlaw Enclosure (SM 6188) Scheduled Monument is located within Route Option 3A, which comprises a prehistoric enclosed settlement.</p> <p>As the asset is below ground, it is unlikely that the Scheduled Monument will be subject to significant changes in setting.</p> <p>There are few Scheduled Monuments within 3km of Route Option 3A, the closest of which comprises, a prehistoric defensive fort and 20th century training trenches (SM13717). It is unlikely that these monuments will be subject to significant changes in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure and careful placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>	<p>The Camp Hill fort (SM 1163) Scheduled Monument is located in Route Option 3B, which comprises prehistoric earthworks believed to be the remains of a later prehistoric fort.</p> <p>Physical changes to this asset must be avoided. Due to its elevated position within the landscape, it is likely that the introduction of grid infrastructure could result in changes in setting, however careful placement and design, may mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>Within the wider landscape (3km) Scheduled Monuments predominately comprise evidence for Prehistoric forts (SM90064) located on the hills overlooking Penicuik. The elevated position of these monuments means that the introduction of grid infrastructure could result in changes in setting, however careful placement and design, may mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>	<p>There are no Scheduled Monuments located within Route Option 3C.</p> <p>Within the wider landscape (3km) Scheduled Monuments range in date and form evidence prehistoric and medieval defensive structures (e.g. Brunston Castle SM1192), and post-medieval industrial limekilns (Bents Quarry SM6065).</p> <p>The elevated position of the defensive Scheduled Monuments means that the introduction of grid infrastructure could result in changes in setting, however careful placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>It is unlikely that any potential change in setting to the post-medieval industrial features would result in significant effects.</p>	<p>There are no Scheduled Monuments within Route Option 3D, or within 3km of it.</p> <p>Within the wider landscape (3km) Scheduled Monuments range in date and form evidence prehistoric and medieval defensive structures (e.g. Brunston Castle SM1192).</p> <p>The elevated position of these monuments means that the introduction of grid infrastructure could result in changes in setting, however careful placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>	<p>There are no Scheduled Monuments within Route Option 3E.</p> <p>Within 3km of the Route Option, the closest monument is Bents Quarry (SM6065) which is located 300m away. Given its nature as a quarry, it is unlikely that the Scheduled Monument t will be subject to significant changes in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure.</p>	<p>There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to potential impact on Scheduled Monuments.</p> <p>The careful placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects</p>
	Listed Buildings (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are seven Listed Buildings within Route Option 3A, two Category A, three Category B and two Category C. The Category A assets are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cockburn Farm / House (LB26792) 17th century farm complex. Bonaly Tower (LB 28033) 18th century farmhouse, with boundary walls, gates, bridge, garden terraces and steps and garden statuary <p>The Category A Listed Buildings may in particular be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, which could be harmful to its appreciation and understanding.</p> <p>The Category B assets are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buteland Farm (LB26779) 19th century farm complex 	<p>There are two Listed Buildings, one Category B and one Category C located in Route Option 3B:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Category B Penicuik Martyrs' Cross House (LB 7461) 18th century house used as a parish school. Category C Boghall Farmhouse (LB2387) 19th century farmhouse. <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, which could be harmful to its appreciation and understanding.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 3B Listed Buildings are concentrated at Penicuik and associated with the Post-Medieval development of the town. Route Option 3B does not appear to be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, screened by intervening</p>	<p>There are no Listed Buildings located in Route Option 3C.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 3C, Listed Buildings are concentrated at Newhall. Route Option 3C does not appear to be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is unlikely to affect how they are understood or appreciated.</p>	<p>There are no Listed Buildings located in Route Option 3D.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 3D, Listed Buildings are concentrated at Penicuik. Route Option 3D does not appear to be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is unlikely to affect how they are understood or appreciated.</p>	<p>There are 4 Listed Buildings within Route Option 3E, one Category A, two Category B, and one Category C.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Category A Sundial Lamancha (LB15177) Category B Entrance gateway (LB 15178) Category B Lamancha (LB15176) Category C Lower Grange (LB15175) <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, which could be harmful to its appreciation and understanding.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 3E there are some Listed Buildings concentrated at the Whim Hall estate. Route Option 3E does not appear to be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is unlikely to</p>	<p>There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to potential impact on Listed Buildings.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Druim (LB46286) with gates and garden terrace, Norman early 20th century ■ Glenbrook Road (LB26857) 19th century stables <p>The Category C assets are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Balleny Bridge (LB26883) late 18th century bridge ■ The Cottage (former Coach House and Stables) (LB49548) at Bonaly Tower, with garden statuary. Late 19th century <p>Within 3km of Route Option 3A, Listed Buildings are concentrated at Balerno, Currie and Colinton on the outskirts of the City of Edinburgh. Route Option 3A does not appear to be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is unlikely to affect how they are understood or appreciated.</p>	topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is unlikely to affect how they are understood or appreciated.			affect how they are understood or appreciated.	
	Conservation Areas (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are two Conservation Areas within Route Option 3A.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Swanston (CA23) a historic village core and associated landscape. ■ Morton Mains (CA30) a historic rural landscape with historic buildings <p>The introduction of grid infrastructure may alter how the Conservation Areas are experienced, however, careful route alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 3A, the following Conservation Areas have been identified:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Currie (CA34) ■ Juniper Green (CA31) ■ Balerno (CA33) ■ Hermiston (CA39) ■ Kirknewton (CA376) <p>Route Option 3A does not appear to be sited on key views along routes through and toward these Conservation Areas so is unlikely to affect how they are experienced or perceived.</p>	There are no Conservation Areas within Route Option 3B, or within 3km of Route Option 3B.	<p>There are no Conservation Areas within Route Option 3C.</p> <p>The closest Conservation Area is Penicuik (CA344) which located within the centre of Penicuik 1.5km away from the Route Option. The Conservation Area will be screened by residential buildings and the introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to be harmful to its setting.</p>	There are no Conservation Areas within Route Option 3D and 3E, or within 3km of them.		There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to potential impact on Conservation Areas.
	Inventory Gardens and Designed	There are no GDLs within Route Option 3A:	There are no GDLs within Route Option 3B.	There are no GDLs within Route Option 3C.	There is one GDL within Route Option 3D:	There are no GDLs in Route Option 3E or within 3km.	Route Option 3C is preferred to 3D as would have a

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
	Landscapes (GDL) (Holford Rule 1)	<p>Within 3km of Route Option 3A there is one GDL:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Malleny (GDL00272) located within the town of Balerno. <p>This GDL will be screened by residential buildings and the introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to be harmful to its setting or result in significant effects.</p>	<p>Within 3km of Route Option 3B there is one GDL:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Penicuik GDL (GDL 00311) a fine example of an 18th century designed landscape. <p>Located 25m away from the edge of Route Option 3B. Its elevated position within the landscape indicates that there will likely be partial visibility of the proposed route, although the introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to alter how the GDL is perceived, and with careful route alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>	<p>Within 3km, Newhall GDL is located c. 175m from Route Option 3C (GDL00297). Newhall is a picturesque landscape laid out along the glen on the River North Esk and is associated with an 18th century house and walled gardens.</p> <p>There will likely be partial visibility of Route Option 3C, although the introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to alter how the GDL is perceived, and with careful route alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Penicuik (GDL 00311) a fine example of an 18th century designed landscape. <p>Situated both within and adjacent to Route Option 3D, there is the potential for both direct physical effects to the GDL and setting changes.</p> <p>Physical changes to the GDL are to be avoided where possible, and changes in setting to be mitigated through the careful positioning of poles, in order to avoid disruption to the experience and appreciation of the GDL, or how the GDL understood in relation to contemporary assets.</p>		lesser impact on GDLs.
	Inventory Historic Battlefields (Holford Rule 1)	There are no inventory listed historic battlefields located within Route Option 3A or within 3km of the Route Option.	<p>The Battle of Rullion Green (BTL27) Inventory Historic Battlefield, which dates to 1666, is located in Route Option 3B. It is unlikely that the Historic Battlefield can be spanned or avoided.</p> <p>Key characteristics of the battlefield can still be identified enabling the events which took place to be more fully understood. The introduction of grid infrastructure will result in changes in setting, and how the asset is experienced. Undergrounding will be at risk of damaging below-ground heritage assets. This area should be avoided.</p>	There are no inventory listed historic battlefields within Route Options 3C, 3D and 3E.			<p>There is no preferred route option between Route Option 3C and 3D with respect to Historic Battlefields.</p> <p>It is recommended that detailed routing avoids the Historic Battlefield within Route Option 3B.</p>
	Non-designated heritage assets (Holford Rule 2)	<p>There are 60 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 3A.</p> <p>Whilst evidence for later prehistoric and Roman occupation are present within Route Option 3A, these assets largely comprise evidence for the post-medieval and modern expansion of the City of Edinburgh. The central section of Route Option 3A contains military remains relating to the Castlelaw and Dreghorn Military Training Area (Canmore ID 277106), a firing range developed during the First World War, and still in active use.</p>	<p>There are 45 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 3B.</p> <p>Evidence for early prehistoric occupation has been identified within the route option, through the recovery of flints, arrowheads and axe heads.</p> <p>Assets range in date and form and include a prehistoric Stone Circle (Canmore ID 51863), Roman military features and roads (e.g. the Border - Crawford - Inveresk Roman Road Canmore ID 71721), through to post-medieval farmsteads and associated agricultural feature, and assets associated with the post-medieval expansion of Townships in Midlothian, e.g. Penicuik.</p>	<p>There are 23 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 3C.</p> <p>These assets largely comprise evidence for post-medieval industry, including collieries and quarries.</p>	<p>There are 7 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 3D.</p> <p>These assets include a prehistoric standing stone (Canmore ID 51642), a Bronze Age funerary cairn (Canmore ID 51626), as well as evidence for medieval and post-medieval agricultural activity.</p>	<p>There are 19 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 3E.</p> <p>These assets largely comprise evidence for, post-medieval and modern agricultural and industrial features, such as farmsteads, mines and tile works, in addition to isolated defences sites, such as the possible 18th century military encampment at Lower Grange (Canmore ID 50226).</p>	<p>Route Option 3D is preferred to 3C as would have a lesser impact on non-designated heritage assets.</p> <p>Physical changes to any non-designated heritage assets are to be avoided where possible and poles are to be sited in a way which does not disrupt how they can be understood in relation to contemporary/ related assets and the surrounding landscape.</p>
	Overall preference for Cultural Heritage	Overall, the preferred Route Option is 3A – 3B – 3D – 3E , as Route Option 3D has the least interactions with designated and non-designated assets which could lead to harm.					

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
Forestry and Woodland	Ancient Woodland Inventory (AWI) (Holford Rule 1)	There are 19 AWI records within or partially within Route Option 3A, totalling 56.8 hectares. The AWI records within the first section of the Route Option as far as Balerno are likely to be avoided. Those further east to the north of the Pentlands are unlikely to be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are 14 AWI records within or partially within Route Option 3B, totalling 57.5 hectares. Of these, it is considered that one AWI cannot be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are two AWI records partially within Route Option 3C, totalling 1.0 hectare. These can be avoided through detailed routeing.	There is one AWI record partially within Option 3D, totalling 0.5 hectares. This AWI can be avoided through detailed routeing.	There is one AWI record partially within Option 3E, total area 0.3 hectares. This AWI can be avoided through detailed routeing.	Route Option 3D is marginally preferred to 3C as there is only one AWIs within 3D. However, it is concluded that both should be able to be avoided through detailed routeing, and therefore there may be no overall preference further down the line. AWIs within Route Option 3B are unlikely to have opportunities to route around them.
	Native Woodland Survey of Scotland (NWSS) (Holford Rule 2)	There are 13 NWSS records within or partially within Route Option 3A, totalling 18.6 hectares. These can be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are fourteen NWSS records within or partially within Route Option 3B, total area 19.875 hectares. These can be avoided through detailed routeing.	There is one NWSS record partially within Route Option 3C, total area 0.57 hectares. The NWSS can be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are two NWSS records within or partially within Route Option 3D, total area 1.152 hectares. These can be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are no NWSS records located within Option 3E.	Route Option 3C is marginally preferred to 3D as it is likely to impact fewer NWSS records. However, it is concluded that, through detailed routeing, these could be avoided, and therefore there may be no overall preference further down the line.
	National Forest Inventory (NFI) (Holford Rule 5)	There are 90 inventory records within or partially within Route Option 3A, totalling 124.5 hectares. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable with this Option.	There are 57 inventory records within or partially within Route Option 3B, totalling 71.9 hectares. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable with this Option.	There are five inventory records within or partially within Route Option 3C, totalling 2.2 hectares. These could be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are 12 inventory records within or partially within Route Option 3D, totalling 3.5 hectares. These could be avoided through detailed routeing.	There 56 inventory records within or partially within Route Option 3E, totalling 205.9 hectares. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable with this Option.	Route Option 3C is preferred to 3D as there are fewer NFI records with a smaller total hectareage.
	Overall preference for Forestry and Woodland	Overall, the overall preferred Route Option for forestry and woodland comprises 3A-3B-3C-3E . Route Option 3C is preferred to 3D as whilst there is one extra AWI in Route Option 3C, this can be avoided through careful routeing, and generally Route Option 3C has fewer woodland designations.					
Peat, Geology, Hydrology & Hydrogeology	NatureScot Priority Peatland Habitats (Class 1 and Class 2) (Holford Rule 1) NatureScot Peatland Habitats (Classes 3, 4 and 5)	Route Option 3A does not cross any areas of Class 1 or 2 priority peatland habitat. The route does not cross any Class 3, 4 or 5 peat noted on NatureScot (2016) mapping.	Route Option 3B does not cross any areas of Class 1 or 2 priority peatland habitat. The route does not cross any Class 3, 4 or 5 peat as noted on NatureScot (2016) mapping.	Route Option 3C crosses over a wide area (840m) of priority Class 1 peatland area in the south of the route at Auchencorth Moss. The Class 1 peatland area covers the full width of the route for a length of around 840m wide and cannot be avoided or spanned. It is understood that this area of peat is being extracted through the extant 1989 consent which was reviewed in 2016. The peat extraction site has permission for peat to be extracted until 2040 ((planning ref. 16/00202/ROMP). There are also several large areas of Class 5 peat within this route option, which extend over the full width of the route option	Route Option 3D crosses over an area of priority Class 1 peatland area in the south of the route at Auchencorth Moss, but this can be avoided within the route. There are also large areas of Class 3 and 5 peat within this route option, which extend for the entire width of the route option for a length of approximately 2.8km wide, which cannot be avoided or spanned.	Route Option 3E crosses over a large area of Class 1 priority peatland southeast of Deepsyke Forest. This area is between 460 and 1.1km long and extends the full width of the route. The Class 1 peatland cannot be spanned or avoided. There are some areas of Class 4 and 5 peat within the route, which cannot be avoided.	Route Options 3C and 3D both cross over priority peatland habitat in the south of the routes. There is scope within Route Option 3D to avoid the Class 1 priority peatland habitat, but there is no scope within 3C to avoid up to 840m of Class 1 peat. There is however within route 3D, large areas of Class 3 and 5 peat

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
				for a total length of approximately 1.2km, which cannot be avoided or spanned.			<p>which cannot be avoided.</p> <p>Based on priority peatland habitat the preferred Route would be 3D. If Route Option 3C were widened in its south extent to avoid the Class 1 peat habitat 3C may be viewed as more preferable.</p> <p>The large area of Class 1 peatland within 3E cannot be avoided or spanned.</p> <p>Overall, Route Option 3 cannot avoid priority Class 1 peatland habitat.</p> <p>Where peat is found, it is likely that there will be some technical difficulties and increase cost, with special foundations and bog shoes required for construction.</p>
	Geological Conservation Review (GCR) Areas	Route Options 3A and 3B do not cross a GCR.		Route Option 3C crosses the Carlops GCR. Provided that the poles can be placed such that they do not alter the existing landforms, there appears to be little technical reason why the presence of this Conservation Area should prevent the use of Route Option 3C, in particular it is not likely to be possible to span much of this area, thereby limiting the requirement for the establishment of poles to support the future overhead cable. This would need to be subject to detailed discussions with Nature Scot.	Route Option 3D crosses the northern boundary of the Carlops GCR near Auchencorth Moss This could be avoided through detailed routeing.	Route Options 3D does not cross a GCR.	Route Option 3D is marginally preferred to Route Option 3C as Route Option 3C cannot span or avoid the GCR. However, the wood poles are unlikely to alter the existing landforms through construction or operation, and therefore the preference is marginal.
	Waterbodies / watercourses	Route Option 3A crosses several named and unnamed watercourses, including Cock Burn, Bavelaw Burn, Bonaly Burn, Braid Burn, Howden Burn, Swanston Burn and other smaller tributaries. The route lies just downgradient of Harlaw Reservoir, and Torduff Reservoir.	Route Option 3B crosses several named and unnamed watercourses, including Cornton Burn, Loan Burn, Grain Burn, Glencorse Burn and Boghall Burn. Glencorse Reservoir, a public drinking water supply reservoir, lies over 1km upgradient to the west of the route.	Route Option 3C crosses one watercourse, as the River North Esk flows east through the centre of the route. There are several small unnamed tributaries within the route.	Route Option 3D crosses the Corton Burn, River North Esk, Hare Burn and Black Burn, as well as several smaller unnamed tributaries.	Route Option 3E has numerous drainage ditches within the route, some smaller unnamed tributaries and a small section of the Dead Burn in the south of the route.	Route Option 3B passes partly through a DWPA. Both Route Options 3C and 3D cross the same watercourse (River North Esk) with very similar flood risk extent (narrow

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference	
	Flood Zones and Drinking Water Protected Areas	SEPA future flood maps indicate only three areas of flood risk along the route option, at Cock Burn, the outflow of Harlaw Reservoir to the Water of Leith (Bavelaw Burn) and the Braid Burn. These flood risk areas are narrow and can be spanned or avoided within Route Option 3A.	SEPA future flood maps indicate areas of fluvial flood risk along Cornton Burn, Glencorse Burn and the downstream extent of Boghall Burn. The widest flood extent is along Glencorse Burn (between 70m and 170m wide) and all can be avoided and spanned. The route passes through the east side of the Glencorse Burn DWPA (Surface) (Waterbody ID 3814).	SEPA future flood mapping indicates a flood risk area associated with the River North Esk, which is up to 70m wide at the route crossing location and can be spanned.	SEPA future flood mapping indicates a flood risk area associated with the River North Esk, which is up to 80m wide at the route crossing location and can be spanned.	SEPA flood maps indicate no areas at fluvial flood risk within the route.	floodplain which can be spanned). In rural areas there is a high likelihood of small burns and waterways which can be identified on a site visit. Therefore, there is a no preference in the route options from a hydrology and flood risk perspective.	
	Overall preference for Peat, Geology, Hydrology & Hydrogeology	The marginally preferred route is via Route Options 3A-3B-3D-3E , as Route Option 3D can span the priority habitat within its route option and is likely to be able to span the Carlops GCR, compared to Route Option 3C's areas of priority habitat and GCR cannot be spanned. The priority Class 1 peatland habitat in Route Option 3E cannot be spanned or avoided.						
Planning and Land Use	Planning and Development: <ul style="list-style-type: none">Local Development Plan (LDP) Allocations. (Holford Rule 7)Committed Development (Consented and Undetermined⁶ Planning Applications) since 2019⁷.	City of Edinburgh LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none">There are no LDP site allocations. Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none">22/03017/FUL – permission granted for a new electricity feeder station from the railway at the proposed electricity substation, Riccarton Mains Road, Currie. Should the new electricity feeder pillar impact the design of the Cloich connection, this will be considered through the design stage	City of Edinburgh – Route Options 3B-3E do not fall within CoEC.					In terms of Planning and Development, Route Option 3D is preferred to 3C as the 'live' peat extraction site (Auchencorth Moss) found to the south of both Route Options can be avoided via Route Option 3D.
		West Lothian – None of the Route Options fall within WLC.						
		South Lanarkshire – None of the Route Options fall within SLC						
		Scottish Borders – Route Options 3A and 3B do not fall within SBC	Scottish Borders LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none">No site allocation within the LDP Policy Map. Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none">There is no committed development of relevance along Route Option 3C within the Scottish Borders Council area (as of 25/04/2024).	Scottish Borders – Route Option 3D does not fall within SBC	Scottish Borders LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none">No site allocation within the LDP Policy Map. Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none">There is no committed development of relevance along Route Option 3E within the Scottish Borders Council area (as of 25/04/2024).			
Midlothian LDP Allocations	Midlothian LDP Allocations	Midlothian LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none">No site allocations within the LDP Policy Map.		Midlothian – Route Option 3E does not fall within MLC				

⁶ Undetermined planning applications are those which have been validated, i.e. are 'live' applications, but have not yet been decided.

⁷ It is not considered that development prior to 2019 should be considered as these applications are likely to have expired if not implemented or fully built out and in situ within 5 years.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No site allocation within the LDP Policy Map. <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no committed development of relevance along Route Option 3A within the Midlothian Council area (as of 25/04/2024). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No site allocation within the LDP Policy Map. <p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 20/00736/FUL – permission granted for erection of three self-catering holiday pods at Old Rullion Cottage, Penicuik. <p>The proposed development is easily avoided through detailed routeing.</p>	<p>Committed Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no committed development of relevance along Route Option 3C or 3D within the Midlothian Council area (as of 25/04/2024). It should be noted that there is a live peat extraction site at Auchencorth Moss (16/00202/ROMP) found to the south of both Route Options 3C (which cannot be spanned) and 3D (which can be spanned). 			
	Scotland Land Capability for Agriculture Classes 1, 2 and 3.1 (Holford Rule 7)	<p>Class 2 and 3.1 prime agricultural land is found to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the start of the route either side of Currie's railway line; In the middle of the route to south of Currie and Bonaly; and At the end of the route around Swanston and Hillend. <p>In some areas, this is unlikely to be avoided through careful routeing.</p>	Northern end of Route Option 3B is LCA Class 2 land (prime land). This could be avoidable if route runs tight to the eastern boundary of the A702 but can't be avoided at Easter Howgate.	Route Options 3C, 3D and 3E do not contain any prime agricultural land (Classes 1, 2, or 3.1).			There is no preferred route option as Route Options 3C and 3D do not contain any prime agricultural land.
	Coal Authority Reporting Area for Planning	The easternmost portion of Route Option 3A falls within a Coal Authority Mining Reporting Area, and Route Option 3B also fall within a Coal Authority Mining Reporting Area. However, the Route Options do not cross any areas of high development risk for coal.	Route Option 3C falls within a Coal Authority Mining Reporting Area. Part of Route Option 3C to the west of Nine Mile Burn, near Harlawmuir, falls within a potential Coal Authority high risk zone. The Coal Authority do not indicate records of previous extraction of coal seams, however, BGS maps and the Coal Authority website indicate the presence of numerous (at least 10) former mineshafts which further confirms the likelihood of previous extraction and shallow workings. Whilst it should be possible to avoid the mine entries if they are accurately located, some investigation would be necessary to determine the depth to and condition of the shallow coal seams and thereafter enable the selection of suitable locations for the siting of poles in order to span over areas of shallow workings. Alternatively, where this is not possible, consolidation of workings should be considered.	Route Option 3D falls within a Coal Authority Mining Reporting Area. Part of Route Option 3D, to the south of Brunstane Cottages falls within a potential Coal Authority high risk zone. The Coal Authority do not indicate records of previous extraction of coal seams, however, BGS maps and the Coal Authority website indicate the presence of three abandoned mineshafts which further confirms the likelihood of previous extraction and shallow workings. Whilst it should be possible to avoid the mine entries, some investigation would be necessary to determine the depth to and condition of the shallow coal seams and thereafter enable the selection of suitable locations for the siting of poles in order to span over areas of shallow workings. Alternatively, where this is not possible, consolidation of workings should be considered.	A coal seam long the A701 is classified as a potential Coal Authority high risk area (to the north of North Grange and Lamancha). The limestone seams in the area to the north of the A701 have been subject to localised quarry, with more extensive quarrying of limestone undertaken in an area to the west of Route Option 3E. It should be possible to avoid or span over these during detailed design stage if this route option is selected. To the north of North Grange and Lamancha the BGS maps and the Coal Authority website indicate the presence of at least five mineshafts indicating that the coal seams in this area have historically been subject to extraction. Two further mineshafts are present adjacent to the western boundary of Route Option 3E, whilst areas of former opencast Coal Extraction which have been reinstated Whilst it should be possible to avoid the mine entries if they are accurately located, some investigation would be necessary to determine the depth to and condition of the shallow coal seams and thereafter enable the selection of suitable locations for the siting of poles in order to span over areas of shallow workings. Alternatively, where this is not possible, consolidation of workings should be considered.	Route Options 3C, 3D and 3E cross relatively extensive areas beneath which coal seams have been worked at shallow depth with, also, some evidence of open cast extraction. Numerous abandoned mineshafts are also present. Investigation would be necessary at alignment stage to confirm the location of the mine entries, and determine the depth to, and condition of, the shallow coal seams and thereafter enable the selection of suitable locations for the siting of poles in order to span over areas of shallow workings. Alternatively, where this is not possible, consolidation of workings could be	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
							considered if these routes were to be progressed with Route Option 3D preferred over Route Option 3C with respect to the mining legacy.
	Overall preference for Planning and Land Use	In terms of Planning and Land Use, the preferred Route Option is 3A-3B-3D-3E. Route Option 3D is preferred to 3C as it interacts with the least amount legacy mines and associated works and can avoid the 'live' peat extraction site found to the south.					
Technical	Altitude and Topography	<p>Most of Route Option 3 is at altitude above 200m. In Scotland, altitudes above 200m AOD are technically, by design, considered to be an extreme environment due to high wind and ice loading. The maximum altitude within Route Option 3 is approximately 375m (Route Option 3C has a maximum altitude of 300m and Route option 3D is 290m for comparison purposes).</p> <p>Given the long length of this route, the slope varies significantly throughout, although a lot of Route Option 3 has a more even surface with approximately 75% of Route Option 3 with a gradient less than 6°. As previously mentioned, there is a lot of topographical variety throughout however, reaching a maximum of 50°, a gradient of this magnitude can cause significant technical challenges during construction as well as operation.</p>					Route Option 3 is at altitudes above 200m and has a varied gradient across the route. Therefore, the technical challenges during construction and operation of any proposed route will need to be factored in at the detailed design stage.
	Infrastructure (Holford Rule 7) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing OHL transmission and distribution infrastructure SP Energy Networks Land Use Risks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 400kV Crossing/Parallel 132kV Crossing Two 275kV crossings are noted in Route Option 3A Eleven 11kV crossings and a number of low-voltage connections located within Route Option 3A. A number of larger roads which will require crossing including a double roundabout and junctions on the A702 into Biggar Road, as well as Old Pentland Rd, A703 and running parallel to A702. There are a number of minor road/track crossing along this route in which statutory clearance requirements will need to be considered. Curriehill Railway Station lies within Route option 3A with a possibility of a double crossing between Currie S/S and National Cycle Route 75. Cognisance of statutory clearance requirements for rail crossings are to be considered. The MOD Castlelaw and Dreghorn Training Area and Ranges (c. 775ha) runs approximately between 3A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ten 11kV crossings and a number of low-voltage connections located within Route Option 3B. There is another potential crossing of the A702 within Route Option 3B. Bathgate to Penicuik high-pressure gas pipeline spans the entire width of Route Option 3B to the south of the route. As Route Option 3B runs parallel to Penicuik, there are a number of minor roads crossed along its route via roads connecting the town to the wider rural landscape 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Five 11kV Crossings and a number of low-voltage connections located within Route Option 3C. Route Option 3C crosses the A766 and a minor track/road adjacent to Auchencorth Moss 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Three 11kV Crossings located within Route Option 3D. Route Option 3D crosses the A766. Bathgate to Penicuik high-pressure gas pipeline crosses Route Option 3D. However, there is no way to route around this pipeline across Route Option 3 as a whole as it spans the entire width of Route Option 3B. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two 33kV lines and four 11kV lines located within Route Option 3E, with two low-voltage connections also noted. Route Option 3E potentially crosses the A701 twice along its route. There are a number of minor road/track crossing along this route in which statutory clearance requirements will need to be considered. 	<p>There is no overall route preference between Route Option 3C and 3D, as whilst 3D has less existing electrical connections, a high-pressure gas pipeline would need to be crossed in Route Option 3D. However, this pipeline would need to be crossed at Route Option 3B too and therefore unavoidable in Route Option 3 whichever route is taken.</p> <p>A full utility search would be required to establish extents of all utility services found within Route Option 3A-3E.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 3A	Route Option 3B	Route Option 3C (Optional)	Route Option 3D (Optional)	Route Option 3E	Preference
		<p>below Dreghorn Training Area and Barracks to Castlelaw Hill. Whilst some public access is allowed through public rights of way, some of the area is fenced off and it is unlikely that the development will be allowed to run through this area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Route Option 3A crosses the Tarmac Ravelrig Quarry, which has an amber risk rating due to known presence of mine workings. A high-pressure gas pipe is present in the Buteland Farm area. 					
	Overall Technical Preference	There is no preferred route option between Route Option 3C and 3D in terms of technical considerations as both the route options cross a similar amount of infrastructure.					
Overall Preferred Route Option		<p>The overall preferred Route Option 3 comprises 3A-3B-3D-3E (hereafter referred to as 'Overall Route Option 3').</p> <p>Overall Route Option 3 crosses the Pentland Hills SLA and the northern edge of the Pentlands Regional Park, and Bonaly Country Park. Whilst Route Option 3 does not pass through any additional locally designated landscapes, the route option is located in and around a number of settlements including around Currie, Balerno, Penicuik and Lamancha, and also a number of core paths.</p> <p>Overall Route Option 3 crosses two Conservation Areas, a Historic Battlefield, and includes a number of Listed Buildings. It will also cross a number of priority peatland habitats which cannot be spanned or avoided, especially within Route Options 3D and 3E. Furthermore, Overall Route Option 3 crosses a number of NFI and NWSS, many of which cannot be avoided.</p> <p>In terms of land use, Overall Route Option 3 has a number of challenging constraints, including the Ravelrig Quarry and the MOD Castlelaw and Dreghorn Training Area and Ranges. Whilst some public access to the MOD area is allowed along public rights of way, some of the area is fenced off and the Training Area presents a significant constraint to OHL routeing.</p> <p>The comparative appraisal of Route Option 3C and Route Option 3D identified Route Option 3D as the preferred route option. Route Option 3D is the shorter of the two route options. Peat extraction is also being undertaken in Route Option 3C which cannot be avoided as it spans the entire route option width. Therefore, with regard to land use, Route Option 3D is preferred to Route Option 3C.</p> <p>Route Option 3D has fewer interactions with non-designated heritage assets than Route Option 3C. However, while Route Option 3D is the preferred route option, it is important to note that this option runs along the western boundary of Penicuik GDL and crosses more LCTs with an overall medium-high sensitivity to OHL development. Therefore, potential heritage and landscape impacts will need to be considered carefully at the detailed routeing stage.</p> <p>In terms of technical considerations, there is no overall route preference between Route Options 3C and 3D; however, Route Option 3D has fewer electrical infrastructure crossings than Route Option 3C. Whilst a high-pressure gas pipeline would need to be crossed with Route Option 3D, this pipeline would need to be crossed with Route Option 3B too and is therefore unavoidable in Overall Route Option 3 whichever route is taken.</p>					

Overall, Route Option 4 would involve selecting Route Option 4A and then 4B, then finish with either Route Option 4C or 4D. Please refer to **Figure 4.4** which sets out the full extent of the Route Options.

Table C.4: Route Options 4A-4C/4D Appraisal

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
Approximate Length of Line Route (km)	Length of Route Option (Holford Rule 3)	c. 22km	c. 11km	c. 7.2km	c. 6.8km	The shortest route would be via Route Options 4A-4B-4D .
Landscape and Visual Amenity	Locally Designated Landscapes, including Special Landscape Areas (SLAs) and the Pentland Hills Regional Park (Holford Rule 2)	Route Option 4A crosses the most westerly extents of the Water of Leith SLA (CoEC), the Pentlands SLA (CEC) and the northern edge of Pentland Hills Regional Park. Additionally, Route Option 4A passes through the northern tip of Bonaly Country Park, and the northern portion of Swanston Conservation Area.	Route Option 4B does not pass through any landscape designations. Route Option 4B passes through the Howgate Conservation Area.	Route Options 4C and 4D do not pass through any local or regional landscape designations.		There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between Route Options 4C and 4D in relation to Landscape Designations.
	Landscape Character Types (LCT) (Holford Rules 4, 5, 6 and 7), including Landscape Susceptibility	Route Option 4A passes through four LCTs, with an overall medium susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 268: Upland Hills – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 269: Upland Fringes – Lothians (low susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 270: Lowland river Valleys – Lothians (medium susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 274: Lowland Plain (low susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 4B passes through three LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 99: Rolling Farmland – Borders (high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 269: Upland Fringes – Lothians (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 270: Lowland river Valleys – Lothians (medium susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 4C passes through two LCTs, with an overall medium-high susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 92: Plateau Outliers (medium susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 99: Rolling Farmland – Borders (high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 4D passes through three LCTs, with an overall medium susceptibility to OHL development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ LCT 92: Plateau Outliers (medium susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 104: Upland Fringe Rough Grassland (low susceptibility for OHL) ■ LCT 114: Pastoral Upland Valley (medium-high susceptibility for OHL) 	Route Option 4C is marginally preferred to 4D as it would have a lesser impact on LCTs.
	Residential Visual Amenity with '150m trigger for consideration zone' (similar to Holford Rule 4)	Route Option 4A includes a number of scattered settlements along much of its route, including; north of the villages of Currie and Balerno, along the A701, south of the Bonaly area, and between Swanston and the Edinburgh Bypass. Generally, opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage, however a pinchpoint around Bonaly Tower may need this buffer distance to be reduced.	Route Option 4B skirts the town of Penicuik to the east and contains scattered properties along the A703, A6094 and B7026, and properties at the edge of the settlement. This area is very constrained by residential properties, particularly between Penicuik and Auchendinny. It is unlikely to be able to route more than 150m from all the dwellings.	There are several residential dwellings scattered along the A701 within Route Option 4C. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage.	There are several residential dwellings scattered along the A703 within Route Option 4D. Opportunities to route more than 150m from the dwellings will be possible at detailed routeing stage.	There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to impact on residential amenity.
	Visual Amenity (similar to Holford Rule 4)	Route Option 4A is likely to impact shelterbelts and areas of ancient woodland to the south of Balerno and Currie, and also near Bonaly, the removal of which would impact key landscape features. The introduction of an OHL would result in the greater encirclement of the settlements of Currie and Balerno, and potentially increase cumulative effects arising from interaction with other OHLs of differing sizes in the area to the north and south of the settlements. The higher elevation of the OHL in comparison to Currie and Balerno may mean the OHL appears against the skyline (depending on route location), however it could also enable backclothing by landform of the Pentlands.	Route Option 4B is likely to impact shelterbelts and areas of ancient woodland near Auchendinny, Howgate and Bilston, the removal of which would impact key landscape features. An OHL is likely to affect views from many of the scattered properties within this section, and would affect views from Glencorse Golf Club, and the golf course which it may need to cross. Route Option 4B runs broadly parallel to the A703, A6094 and B7026 roads and receptors travelling along these roads may experience sequential views of the OHL for several kilometres. Roadside vegetation will provide some screening of views.	Much of Route Option 4C runs parallel to the A701 and receptors travelling along this main route may experience sequential views of the OHL for several kilometres. The OHL will appear partially backclothed by landform and forestry along this route option but may break the skyline in some areas. Depending on the route, forestry blocks and shelterbelts may be impacted. Users of Leadburn Community Woodland will need to be considered, to the south of Leadburn.	The northern extent of Route Option 4D runs broadly parallel to the A703. Receptors travelling along this main route may experience sequential views of the OHL for several kilometres, including cumulative effects arising from interactions with several local distribution lines north of Millenium Farm. Users of Leadburn Community Woodland will need to be considered, to the south of Leadburn. Avoidance should be possible through detailed routeing. From the A703, the OHL will appear to largely sit above the skyline in views to the west but may be afforded some backclothing by forestry. Route Option 4D is likely to impact the forestry on White Rig towards Cloich Forest, and more localised shelterbelts	Route Option 4C is preferred to 4D as it would have a lesser impact on Visual Amenity, including impacts on the A703 and the Leadburn Community Woodland.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
					which are a key landscape feature. Efforts should be made to avoid these.	
	Tourism and Recreation: potential for views from OS promoted viewpoints, Sustrans routes, Core Paths, long distance promoted trails, tourist attractions and recreational areas such as golf courses and Country Parks (Notes on Clarification to the Holford Rules)	Route Option 4A crosses a number of core paths, including City of Edinburgh Council core paths CEC 2: The Braids, CEC 19: Harlaw and Threipmuir, AND CEC 20: Bonaly and Bonaly Links. Core paths lead to the Pentland Hills Regional Park, and local designations such as the Red Moss of Balerno Nature Reserve and Bonaly Country Park. The route also passes the on-road National Cycle Network (Route 75) north of Currie. Route Option 4A does not cross any further OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note. The Swanston Golf Course is immediately adjacent to the route option, and part of its driving range is within the section under the existing OHLs.	Route Option 4B contains part of the traffic free National Cycle Route (Route 196 - Penicuik to Musselburgh cycle-walkway), which closely follows the River North Esk. There are no OS promoted viewpoints or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 4B.	Several Scottish Borders Council right of way paths pass through Route Option 4C, including along the dismantled railway near Leadburn Community Woodland. There are no OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 4C.	Several Scottish Borders Council right of way paths pass through Route Option 4D, including along the dismantled railway near Leadburn Community Woodland. There are no OS promoted viewpoints, long distance trails, or tourist attractions of note within Route Option 4D, as it avoids the Scottish Borders Council promoted 'Cloich Loop' route to the south.	There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to Tourism and Recreation.
	Overall preference for Landscape and Visual Amenity	The preferred Route Option for Landscape and Visual Amenity is 4A-4B-4C as Route Option 4C would have a lesser impact on LCTs and visual amenity when compared to Route Option 4D.				
Biodiversity	Ramsar Sites (Holford Rule 1)	The Route Options do not contain any Ramsar sites, and none are within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of a Ramsar Site.				There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to Ramsar sites.
	Special Protection Areas (SPA) (Holford Rule 1)	The Route Options do not contain any SPAs, and none are within the 2km trigger for consideration zone of a SPA.				There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to SPAs.
	Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 4A. Route Option 4A is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Balerno Common SSSI (ash woodland and geological features).	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 4B. Route Option 4B is within the 1km trigger for consideration zones of the Black Burn SSSI (fen and grassland habitat) and the Bilston Burn SSSI (ash woodland and geological features).	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 4C. Route Option 4C is within the 1km trigger for consideration zones of the Whim Bog SSSI (raised bog habitat).	There are no SSSIs within Route Option 4D.	Route Option 4D is preferred to 4C as it is further away from the Whim Bog SSSI. Therefore, overall, Route Option 4D has a lesser impact on SSSIs than 4C.
	Special Areas of Conservation (SAC) (Holford Rule 1)	There are no SACs in Route Options 4A, 4B and 4C, and none of the Route Options are within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of a SAC.			There are no SACs within Route Option 4D. Route Option 4D is within the 1km trigger for consideration zone of the Riven Tweed SAC, however this zone could be avoided through detailed routeing.	Route Options 4A, 4B and 4C are marginally preferred to 4D as they have a slightly reduced impact on SACs.
	Scottish Wildlife Trust (SWT) Reserves (Holford Rule 2)	The Erraid Wood SWT reserve partly overlaps with Route Option 4A but can be avoided through routeing.	One SWT reserve, Milkhall Pond, is entirely within route Option 4B but can be avoided through routeing.	There are no SWT Reserves within Route Options 4C and 4D.		There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to SWT Reserves.
	Local Nature Conservation Sites (LNCS), Local Biodiversity Sites (LBS) and Local Wildlife Sites (LWS) (Holford Rule 2)	There are nine LNCSs within, or partially within, Route Option 4A: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Riccarton Estate (biodiversity) ■ Dalmahoy Hill / Kaimes Hill / Ravelrig Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) ■ Harelaw Reservoir/Water of Leith/Bavelaw Burn/Black Springs/Threipmuir & Harlaw 	The width of Route Option 4B crosses the following five LNCS, which cannot be avoided, but all of which could be spanned: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Glencorse Valley and Logan Burn (biodiversity) ■ Bush Estate and Glencorse Burn (biodiversity) ■ Bonnyrigg to Penicuik Railway (biodiversity) 	Route Options 4C and 4D partly cross the Leadburn Community Woodland (biodiversity) LNCS, but this could be avoided through detailed routeing.		There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to LWSs / LNCs.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
		<p>Reservoirs (biodiversity / geodiversity)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Water of Leith - Inveroe to Glenbrook & Cock Burn (biodiversity) Bavelaw Burn (biodiversity) Torphin Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) Howden Burn/Redford Brae & Laverock Dale/Torduff Reservoir & Bonaly Burn Swanston Burn (biodiversity) Erraid Wood (biodiversity) <p>Dalmahoy Hill / Kaimes Hill / Ravelrig Quarry (biodiversity / geodiversity) LNCS crosses the width of the Route Option and cannot be avoided or spanned.</p> <p>Route Option 4A crosses the Harelaw Reservoir LNCS three times, and the Howden Burn LNCS twice. However, is likely these can be spanned at their narrowest points at the detailed routeing stage.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> River North Esk – Dalkeith to Carlops (biodiversity) Beeslack Wood and Haughhead (biodiversity) <p>A further five LNCSs are located within, or partially within Route Option 4B:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roslin-Moat and Curling Pond (biodiversity) Bush Estate (biodiversity) Penicuik Mill Lade and the River Esk to Esk Bridge (biodiversity) Milkhall Pond (biodiversity) Leadburn Community Woodland (biodiversity) <p>These could be avoided through detailed routeing.</p>			
	Overall preference for Biodiversity	<p>Route Option 4A-4B-4C is the preferred Route Option.</p> <p>Route Option 4C is marginally preferred to 4D as it does not lie within 1km of a SAC.</p>				
Cultural Heritage	Scheduled Monuments (Holford Rule 1)	<p>The Harlaw Enclosure (SM 6188) Scheduled Monument is located within Route Option 4A, which comprises a prehistoric enclosed settlement.</p> <p>As the asset is below-ground, it is unlikely that the Scheduled Monument will be subject to significant changes in setting.</p> <p>There are few Scheduled Monuments within 3km of Route Option 4A, the closest of which comprises, a prehistoric defensive fort and 20th century training trenches (SM13717). It is unlikely that these monuments will be subject to significant changes in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure and careful placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>	<p>Route Option 4B does not contain any Scheduled Monuments.</p> <p>Within the wider landscape Scheduled Monuments predominately comprise evidence for medieval defences, e.g. Old Woodhouselee Castle (SM5607), situated at strategic positions within the landscape adjacent to water courses and at elevated positions.</p>	<p>Route Option 4C does not contain any Scheduled Monuments.</p> <p>The closest Scheduled Monument comprises Bents Quarry (SM6065), situated c. 450 m west. However, due to the positioning, form and function of the Scheduled Monument the proposed grid infrastructure it is unlikely to result in harmful effects as a result of changes in setting.</p>	<p>Route Option 4D does not contain any Scheduled Monuments.</p> <p>The closest Scheduled Monument comprises Northshield Rings fort 'The Camps' (SM731), situated c. 2.3km to the south of the Route Option 4D, and located within forestry. Therefore, grid infrastructure will likely be screened by the forestry, and is unlikely to result in harmful effects as a result of changes in setting.</p>	<p>There is no overall preferred route option as all Scheduled Monuments are located outside the Route Options, and it is considered that an OHL in this route location is unlikely to result in effects.</p> <p>Physical changes to these assets are to be avoided. The introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to result in harmful effects to Scheduled Monuments as a result of changes in setting. The careful placement and design of infrastructure is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>
	Listed Buildings (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are seven Listed Buildings located within Route Option 4A: two Category A, two Category B and two Category C. The Category A assets are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cockburn Farm / House (LB26792) 17th century farm complex. Bonaly Tower (LB 28033) 18th century farmhouse, with boundary walls, gates, bridge, garden terraces and steps and garden statuary <p>The Category A Listed Buildings may in particular be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of</p>	<p>There are five Listed Buildings located in Route Option 4B: one Category B and four Category C Listed Buildings.</p> <p>These buildings all date from the 18th century onwards and pertain to the growth and expansion of the post-medieval agrarian economy and the development of Cowgate.</p> <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, that could be harmful to how the buildings are appreciated and understood today.</p>	<p>There are 16 Listed Buildings located in Route Option 4C; one Category A, three Category B and 12 Category C.</p> <p>The Category A building comprises a 17th century sundial in Lamancha (LB15177), which lies in front of the Category B listed Lamancha house (LB15176) and nearby Category B listed entrance gateway to the house (LB15178). The oldest part of the Lamancha property dates back to the mid-17th century.</p> <p>The other Category B building comprises the Gate Lodge at Whim House (LB15151), a late 18th century building.</p>	<p>Route Option 4D does not contain any Listed Buildings.</p> <p>There are no Listed Buildings identified within 3km of Route Option 4D, where the introduction of grid infrastructure may result in harmful effects as a result of changes in setting.</p>	<p>Route Option 4D is preferred to 4C as there are no Listed Buildings located within, or around Route Option 4D.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
		<p>grid infrastructure, which could be harmful to its appreciation and understanding.</p> <p>The Category B assets are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Buteland Farm (LB26779) 19th century farm complex ■ Druim (LB46286) with gates and garden terrace, Norman early 20th century ■ Glenbook Road (LB26857) 19th century stables <p>The Category C assets are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Balleny Bridge (LB26883) late 18th century bridge ■ The Cottage (former Coach House and Stables) (LB49548) at Bonaly Tower, with garden statuary. Late 19th century <p>Within 3km of Route Option 4A Listed Buildings are concentrated at Balerno, Currie and Colinton on the outskirts of the City of Edinburgh.</p> <p>Route Option 4A does not appear to be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is unlikely to affect how they are understood or appreciated.</p>	<p>Outside Route Option 4B and within 3 km, Listed Buildings are concentrated at Penicuik, Auchendinn and Bilston. Route Option 4B does not appear to be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, screened by intervening topography, development and/or vegetation, and it is unlikely to affect how they are understood or appreciated.</p>	<p>The remaining Category C buildings largely date from the 18th century onwards and pertain to the growth and expansion of the post-medieval agrarian economy and the development of larger rural estates at Lamancha, Whim House and Madrisa.</p> <p>These Listed Buildings may be susceptible to a change in setting as a result of the introduction of grid infrastructure, that could be harmful to how the buildings are appreciated and understood today.</p> <p>Outside Route Option 4C and within 3km, Listed Buildings are mainly concentrated at the Whim Hall estate.</p> <p>Route Option 4C may be sited within the setting of these Listed Buildings, however the careful placement and design of infrastructure is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p>		
	Conservation Areas (Holford Rule 1)	<p>There are two Conservation Areas located within Route Option 4A:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Swanston (CA23) a historic village core and associated landscape. ■ Morton Mains (CA30) a historic rural landscape with historic buildings <p>The introduction of grid infrastructure may alter how the Conservation Area's are experienced, however, careful alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 4A, the following Conservation Areas have been identified:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Currie (CA34) ■ Juniper Green (CA31) ■ Balerno (CA33) ■ Hermiston (CA39) ■ Kirknewton (CA376) <p>Route Option 4A does not appear to be sited on key views along routes through and toward these Conservation Areas so it is unlikely to affect how they are experienced or perceived.</p>	<p>The Howgate Conservation Area (CA338) is located in Route Option 4B.</p> <p>The introduction of grid infrastructure may alter how the Conservation Area is experienced, however, careful route alignment, pole placement and design, is likely to mitigate any potential significant effects.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 4B, the following Conservation Areas have been identified:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Penicuik (CA344) ■ Roslin (CA341) ■ Morton Mains (CA30) ■ Mavisbank (CA351) ■ Gilmerton (CA21) ■ Swanston (CA23) <p>Route Option 4B does not appear to be sited on key views along routes through and toward these Conservation Areas so it is unlikely to affect how they are experienced or perceived.</p>	<p>There are no Conservation Areas located within Route Option 4C and 4D, or within 3km of them.</p>		<p>There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to Conservation Areas.</p>
	Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscapes (GDL) (Holford Rule 1)	<p>Route Option 4A does not cross any GDLs.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 4A there is one GDL:</p>	<p>Route Option 4B does not cross any GDLs.</p> <p>Within 3km of Route Option 4B there are three GDLs:</p>	<p>Route Option 4C does not cross any GDLs, and there are no GDLs identified within 3km of Route Option 4C.</p>	<p>Route Option 4D does not cross any GDLs.</p> <p>Portmore GDL (GDL00318), an 19th-century country residence set within a larger agricultural estate, is located within</p>	<p>Route Option 4C is the preferred Route Option compared to 4D as it does not pass through or near any GDLs.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Malleny (GDL00272) located within the town of Balerno. <p>This GDL will be screened by residential buildings and the introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to be harmful to their setting or result in significant effects.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Penicuik (GDL00311) Roslin Glen and Hawthornden Castle (GDL00327) Mavisbank (GDL00275) <p>Route Option 4B does not appear to be sited on designed views from or towards these landscapes and the introduction of grid infrastructure is unlikely to affect how they are experienced or perceived.</p>		<p>3km of Route Option 4D and situated immediately adjacent to it.</p> <p>The introduction of grid infrastructure in close proximity and along key designed views within the GDL, may result significant changes in setting that could be harmful to how the buildings are appreciated and understood today.</p> <p>The careful placement and design of infrastructure may reduce levels of harm and mitigate any potential significant effect,</p>	
	Inventory Historic Battlefields (Holford Rule 1)	There are no inventory listed historic battlefields within Route Option 4A or within 3km of the Route Option.	<p>There are no inventory listed historic battlefields within Route Option 4B.</p> <p>Within 3km there are two identified Inventory battlefields:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Battle of Rullion Green (BTL27) Battle of Roslin (BT37) <p>Key characteristics of the battlefield can still be identified enabling the events which took place to be more fully understood. The introduction of grid infrastructure within the landscape surrounding these battlefields may result in changes in setting, and how these assets are experienced. However, the careful placement and design of infrastructure may reduce levels of harm and mitigate any potential significant effect.</p>	Route Option 4C and 4D is not located on any inventory listed historic battlefields, nor are any Historic Battlefields located within 3 km of the two routes.		There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to Inventory Historic Battlefields.
	Non-designated heritage assets (Holford Rule 2)	<p>There are 60 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 4A.</p> <p>Whilst evidence for later prehistoric and Roman occupation are present within Route Option 4A, these assets largely comprise evidence for the post-medieval and modern expansion of greater Edinburgh area. The central section of the Route Option 4A contains the remains of Castlelaw and Dreghorn Military Training Area (Canmore ID 277106), a former firing range in use from the First World War.</p>	<p>There are 39 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 4B.</p> <p>Evidence for early prehistoric occupation has been identified within Route Option 4B, through the recovery of isolated finds, with later occupation evidenced by the extent of railway infrastructure, and assets associated with the post-medieval expansion of Townships in Midlothian, e.g. Penicuik.</p>	<p>There are 37 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 4C.</p> <p>These assets largely pertain to railway infrastructure, and assets associated with the post-medieval agrarian economy.</p>	<p>There are 36 non-designated heritage assets located in Route Option 4D.</p> <p>Evidence for early prehistoric occupation has been identified within Route Option 4D, through the recovery of isolated finds, with later occupation evidenced by post-medieval agricultural and industrial practices and the post-medieval development of the Scottish Borders.</p>	<p>Route Option 4D is marginally preferred as a Route Option compared to 4C. However, at this stage it is not likely to result in a notable difference between the routes in relation to non-designated heritage assets. These constraints will be established through more detailed routeing.</p> <p>Physical changes to any non-designated heritage assets are to be avoided where possible and poles are to be sited in a way which does not disrupt how they can be understood in relation to contemporary/ related assets and the surrounding landscape.</p>
	Overall preference for Cultural Heritage	<p>The overall preferred Route Option for Cultural Heritage is 4A-4B-4D.</p> <p>Route Option 4D is preferred to 4C as it would result in the least impact on designated and non-designated heritage assets when compared to 4C.</p>				
Forestry and Woodland	Ancient Woodland Inventory (AWI) (Holford Rule 1)	There are 19 AWI records within or partially within Route Option 4A, totalling 56.8 hectares. The AWI records within the first section of the Route Option as far as Balerno are likely to be avoided. Those further east to the north of the Pentlands are unlikely to be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are eight AWI records within or partially within Option 4B, total area 23.7 hectares. The central and southern areas cannot be avoided.	There are no AWI records within Options 4C and 4D.		There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to Ancient Woodland.
	Native Woodland Survey of Scotland (NWSS) (Holford Rule 2)	There are 13 NWSS records within or partially within Route Option 4A, totalling 18.6 hectares. These can be avoided through detailed routeing.	There are eight NWSS records within or partially within Route Option 4B, total area 19.1 hectares. One of these areas cannot be avoided.	There are no NWSS records within Option 4C	There are two NWSS records within Option 4D, total area 3.2 hectares. Both can be avoided.	Route Option 4C is preferred to 4D as it contains no NWSS records, and therefore will have a lesser impact on NWSSs than 4D.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference	
	National Forest Inventory (NFI) (Holford Rule 5)	There are 90 NFI records within or partially within Route Option 4A, totalling 124.5 hectares. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable with this Option.	There are 56 NFI records within or partially within Route Option 4B, totalling 85.9 hectares. Some loss of woodland is considered unavoidable within this route option. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable with this Option.	There are 51 inventory records within Route Option 4C, totalling 202.9 hectares. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable with this Option.	There are 67 inventory records within, or partially within, Route Option 4D, totalling 265.5 hectares. Some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable with this Option.	Route Option 4C is preferred to 4D as it contains fewer NFI records. Either way some loss of forest cover would be unavoidable.	
	Overall preference for Forestry	The preferred Route Option for Forestry is 4A-4B-4C due to Route Option 4C having a significantly smaller proportion of NFI records, and no NWSS records within it.					
Peat, Geology, Hydrology & Hydrogeology	NatureScot Priority Peatland Habitats (Class 1 and Class 2) (Holford Rule 1) NatureScot Peatland Habitats (Classes 3, 4 and 5)	There are no priority peatland areas (Class 1 and 2) within Route Option 4A. Route Option 4A does not cross any Class 3, 4 or 5 peat noted on NatureScot (2016) mapping.	There are no priority peatland areas (Class 1 and 2) within the route. There are three very small areas of Class 5 peat within the route, all of which can be avoided or spanned.	There are no priority peatland areas (Class 1 and 2) within the route. The route crosses over 2 areas of Class 5 peat, both of which can be avoided within Route Option 4C.	There are no priority peatland areas (Class 1 and 2) within the route. The route crosses several small areas of Class 3, 4 and 5 peat, as well as one large section of Class 4 and 5 peat in the south of the route up to 2.2km wide which could be difficult to avoid.	There is a marginal preference for Route Option 4C on the basis that Route Option 4D crosses over several wide areas of Class 4 and 5 peatland that are difficult to span/avoid (south of route around Middle Burn). However, Route Options 4C and 4D (or the route in general) do not cross any priority peatland habitat. Where peat is found, it is likely that there will be some technical difficulties and increase cost, with special foundations and bog shoes required for construction.	
	Geological Conservation Review (GCR) Area	There are no GCR areas within any of the route options.					There is no preference with respect to GCRs.
	Waterbodies / Watercourses	Route Option 4A crosses several named and unnamed watercourses, including Cock Burn, Bavelaw Burn, Bonaly Burn, Braid Burn, Howden Burn, Swanston Burn and other smaller tributaries. The route lies just downgradient of Harlaw Reservoir, and Torduff Reservoir.	Route Option 4B crosses numerous named and unnamed watercourses, including River North Esk, Glencorse Burn and the Boghall Burn. The Lead Burn runs within the route for approximately 2.5km.	Route Option 4C crosses an unnamed tributary of the Lead Burn.	Route Option 4D crosses several watercourses including Middle Burn, Eddleston Water and other small tributaries within the route.	There is a slight preference for Route Option 4C , instead of taking 4D as route option 4D crosses more watercourses and flood risk areas compared to 4C. There is no alternative route to avoid the Glencorse Burn Drinking Water Protected Area.	
	Flood Zones and Drinking Water Protected Areas	SEPA future flood maps indicate only three areas of flood risk along the route option, at Cock Burn, the outflow of Harlaw Reservoir to the Water of Leith (Bavelaw Burn) and the Braid Burn. These flood risk areas are narrow and can be spanned or avoided within Route Option 4A.	SEPA future flood mapping indicates several fluvial flood risk areas, including along the Boghall Burn, Glencorse Burn, Lead Burn and the River North Esk. The widest flood risk area is associated within the Boghall Burn (up to 130m wide) but this and all the other flood risk areas can be spanned. Milkhall Pond lies within Route Option 4B. The route crosses within the downstream, eastern side of the Glencorse Burn DWPA (Waterbody ID 3814) which cannot be avoided.	There are no areas of fluvial flood risk within the route option shown on SEPA future flood mapping.	SEPA future flood maps show narrow flood risk area along the Eddleston Burn and Middle Burn, both of which can be spanned.	In rural areas there is a high likelihood of small burns and waterways which will be able to be identified on a site visit.	
	Overall preference for Hydrology, Hydrogeology and Peat	The marginally preferred Route Option is 4A-4B-4C as Route Option 4C would cross the least amount of Class 4 and 5 peatland, watercourses and flood risk areas.					
Planning and Land Use	Planning and Development: ■ Local Development Plan (LDP) Allocations.	City of Edinburgh LDP Allocations ■ No site allocations within the LDP Policy Map. Committed Development	City of Edinburgh None of the Route Options fall within CofEC			There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to committed development.	

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
	(Holford Rule 7) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Committed Development (Consented and Undetermined⁸ Planning Applications) since 2019⁹. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 22/03017/FUL – permission granted for a new electricity feeder station from the railway at the proposed electricity substation, Riccarton Mains Road, Currie. Should the new electricity feeder pillar impact the design of the Cloich connection, this will be considered through the design stage 				
		West Lothian – None of the Route Options fall within WLC.				
		South Lanarkshire – None of the Route Options fall within SLC.				
		Scottish Borders – Route Option4A does not fall within SBC.	Scottish Borders LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No allocation within the LDP Policy Map. Committed Development There is no committed development of relevance in Route Option 4B or 4C within the Scottish Borders Council area (as of 25/04/2024).	Scottish Borders LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No allocation within the LDP Policy Map. Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 23/00678/HAZ - permission granted for storage of Liquefied Petroleum Gas (LPG) for agricultural activities associated with the farm, at Millenium Poultry Farm, Cowieslinn, Peebles, Scottish Borders, EH45 8FF. It is likely this proposed development can be avoided through detailed routeing.		
		Midlothian LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Midlothian Snowsports Centre (VIS3) Pentland Hills Regional Park (RD3) Country Parks (RD4) Special Landscape Area (ENV6) Committed Development There is no Committed Development of relevance along Route Option 4A within the Midlothian Council area (as of 25/04/2024).	Midlothian LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Committed Development (STRAT1) Strategic Housing Land Allocations (STRAT3) Midlothian Science Zone (ECON2) Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 23/00474/DPP – permission granted for the erection of 32 dwellinghouses, Land South East of Auchendinny The Brae Auchendinny Penicuik, City of Edinburgh 20/00144/DPP - residential development formation of access roads and car parking and associated works on land at former Wellington School, south of Penicuik, City of Edinburgh. It is likely these committed developments can be avoided through detailed routeing.	Midlothian LDP Allocations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are no housing or minerals allocations in Route Option 4C Committed Development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 23/01488/FUL DPP – permission granted for the erection of three glamping pods and associated infrastructure at land West Of Old Station Cowdenburn West Linton Scottish Borders It is likely this committed development can be avoided through detailed routeing.	Midlothian Route Option 4D does not fall within MLC.	
	Scotland Land Capability for Agriculture Classes 1, 2 and 3.1 (Holford Rule 7)	Class 2 and 3.1 prime agricultural land is found to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the start of the route either side of Currie's railway line; 	Route Option 4B contains a mixture of Class 2 and Class 3.1 prime agricultural land around Seafield within the northern portion and middle portion of the route, which is unavoidable.	Route Option 4C and 4D do not contain any prime agricultural land (Classes 1, 2, or 3.1).		There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to prime agricultural land.

⁸ Undetermined planning applications are those which have been validated, i.e. are 'live' applications, but have not yet been decided.

⁹ It is not considered that development prior to 2019 should be considered as these applications are likely to have expired if not implemented or fully built out and in situ within 5 years.

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In the middle of the route to south of Currie and Bonaly; and At the end of the route around Swanston and Hillend. <p>In some areas, this is unlikely to be avoided through careful routing.</p>				
	Coal Authority Reporting Area for Planning	The easternmost portion of Route Option 4A falls within a Coal Authority Mining Reporting Area but does not cross any areas of high development risk for coal.	<p>Route Option 4B falls within a Coal Mining Reporting Area. A swathe of land located partly beneath and to the west of the A6094 up to the settlement of Howgate is classified as a potential Coal Authority high risk area. There are no records of extraction of the mineral seams present within the area to the west of the A6094, and hence the western portion of the Route Option 4B corridor to the south of Howgate, the potential for unrecorded extraction cannot be discounted.</p> <p>Some localised intrusive investigation would confirm the presence or otherwise of any unrecorded workings.</p> <p>More generally, the southern part of this Route Option locally runs parallel to the Southern Upland Fault. Whilst it is extremely unlikely that any significant movement would occur along the fault it would be preferable to avoid placing pole infrastructure directly over or in the immediate vicinity of this fault line.</p>	<p>Route Option 4C mostly crosses a Coal Mining Reporting Area.</p> <p>The first section of Route Option 4C (to the south of the Southern Upland Fault) along the A701 broadly follows a fault line, which comprises sandstone and siltstones.</p> <p>A swathe of land to the north of the fault and along the line of the A701 is classified as a potential Coal Authority high risk area.</p> <p>There are no records of previous extraction of coal seams, however, the BGS maps identify former indications of shallow workings adjacent to coal seam outcrops to the east and west of the A701 in the areas to the east of Whim Hall.</p> <p>An abandoned mineshaft is also indicated on maps although is not recorded on the Coal Authority website. It should be possible to avoid the majority of the potentially at risk areas if the overhead line is situated along the southern edge of Route Option 4C where it runs adjacent to the A701.</p>	<p>Route Option 4D does not fall within a Coal Mining Reporting Area.</p> <p>However, it is noted that sands and gravels have been quarried to the north and to the south of Cowieslenn Dene (currently under the operation of Breedon) with materials still actively being removed from the area to the south of this water course.</p> <p>Areas of made ground and ongoing extraction could be avoided by utilising the western part of the Route Option 4D corridor or the eastern fringes in the vicinity of Cowieslenn.</p>	There is no preferred route option between Route Option 4C and 4D as whilst 4D has current sand extraction, 4C also requires the avoidance of potential shallow workings and abandoned mine shafts.
	Overall preference for Planning and Land Use	There is no preferred route option between Route Option 4C and 4D in terms of land use and planning.				
Technical	Altitude and Topography	Route Option 4A has a maximum altitude reaching 240m. This is given an Amber (Medium Risk) rating. Initially, Route Option 4A is predominantly less than 200m AOD up to Balerno, and then 92% of Route 4A is below 22° in gradient. The maximum gradient of Route Option 4A and 4A is around 30°. This is also considered to be a medium risk.	<p>Approximately 50% of Route Option 4B has an altitude greater than 200m, with maximum altitudes reaching 300m. This is given an Amber (Medium Risk) rating.</p> <p>In total, 92% of Route Option 4B is below 22° in gradient. The maximum gradient of Route Option 4B is c. 30°.</p>	<p>All of Route 4C and 4D have an attitude above 200m. In Scotland, altitudes above 200m AOD are technically, by design, considered to be an extreme environment due to high wind and ice loading. Both routes have an amber (medium risk) rating.</p> <p>The maximum altitude reaches 375m in Route Option 4C and 350m in Route Option 4D.</p> <p>Routes 4C and 4D are generally less than 22°, but there are more challenging areas within both Route Options which have a maximum slope of around 39°. These areas should be avoided if possible.</p>	<p>There is no preferred route option as there is no notable difference between the routes in relation to altitude and topography.</p> <p>In Scotland, altitudes above 200m AOD are technically, by design, considered to be an extreme environment due to high wind and ice loading, and should be avoided.</p>	
	Infrastructure (Holford Rule 7) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing OHL transmission and distribution infrastructure SP Energy Networks Land Use Risks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 400kV Crossing/Parallel 132kV Crossing Two 275kV crossings are noted in Route Option 4A Eleven 11kV crossings and a number of low-voltage connections located within Route Option 4A A number of larger roads which will require crossing including a double roundabout and junctions on the A702 into Biggar Road, as well as Old Pentland Rd, A703 and running parallel to A702. There are a number of minor road/track crossing along this route in which statutory clearance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Four 33kV Crossing are noted in Route Option 4B Sixteen 11kV crossing are located within Route Option 4B Route Option 4B crosses the Glencorse Golf Club. This is considered to carry a red (High risk) rating for technical feasibility. The most notable crossings within Route 4B are the A701, Peebles Road, A6074, B7026 and Bush Loan Road. A high-pressure gas pipeline spans the whole width of Route Option 4B and cannot be avoided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two 33kV Crossings are noted in Route Option 4C Route Option 4C crosses seven 11kV crossings and a low-voltage connection Route Option 4C includes the A701, which may need to be crossed subject to detailed routing. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Six 33kV crossings are noted within Route Option 4D. Five 11kV crossings and a number of low-voltage connections are noted within Route Option 4D. Route Option 4D includes the A703, which may need to be crossed subject to detailed routing. 	<p>In terms of electrical infrastructure, Route Option 4C is marginally preferred to 4D as it contains less electrical infrastructure, and in terms of existing road infrastructure.</p> <p>However, both routes would require smaller roads / tracks to be crossed.</p>

Criterion	Sub-Criteria	Route Option 4A	Route Option 4B	Route Option 4C (Optional)	Route Option 4D (Optional)	Preference
		<p>requirements will need to be considered.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curriehill Railway Station lies within Route Option 4A with a possibility of a double crossing between Currie S/S and National Cycle Route 75. Cognisance of statutory clearance requirements for rail crossings are to be considered. The MOD Castlelaw and Dreghorn Training Area and Ranges (c. 775ha) runs approximately between 4A below Dreghorn Training Area and Barracks to Castlelaw Hill. Whilst some public access is allowed through public rights of way, some of the area is fenced off and it is unlikely that the development will be allowed to run through this area. Route Option 4A crosses the Tarmac Ravelrig Quarry, which has an amber risk rating due to known presence of mine workings. A high-pressure gas pipe is present in the Buteland Farm area. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Large number of residences/farms in Route Option 4B most notably Auchendinny. 			
	Overall preference for Technical Constraints	Overall, the preferred route option in terms of Technical Constraints is 4A-4B-4C. Route Option 4C is preferred to 4D as it contains less electrical and road infrastructure.				
Overall Preferred Route Option	<p>The overall preferred Route Option 4 comprises 4A-4B-4C (hereafter referred to as 'Overall Route Option 4').</p> <p>This Overall Route Option crosses the least amount of peatland habitat (Class 4 and 5), crosses fewer watercourses and flood risk areas, and fewer NFI records. However, Overall Route Option 4 will result in likely impacts to designated and non-designated heritage assets, including three Conservation Areas and a number of listed buildings.</p> <p>Furthermore, Route Option 4A and 4B are very constrained by residential properties, particularly north of the villages of Currie and Balerno; along the A701; south of the Bonaly area; between Swanston and the Edinburgh Bypass; and between Penicuik and Auchendinny. It is unlikely to be able to route more than 150m from all the dwellings.</p> <p>The comparative appraisal of Route Option 4C and Route Option 4D identified Route Option 4C as the preferred option as it the least impact on LCTs and on visual amenity, including on road receptors.</p> <p>Route Option 4C is not within 2km of a SAC and crosses the least amount of peatland habitat (with Route Option 4D crossing several wide areas of Class 4 and 5 peatland). Route Option 4C also crosses fewer watercourses and flood risk areas. Route Option 4C has fewer NFI records and no NWSS records and also less impact on the Leadburn Community Woodland.</p> <p>Route Option 4C has less technical constraints, including the consideration of electrical infrastructure and existing road infrastructure.</p> <p>Notwithstanding this, Route Option 4C has the potential to impact both a number of Listed Buildings and additional non-designated heritage assets and these would need to be considered carefully at the detailed routeing stage.</p>					